

MINUTES

**Present: Councilmember Austin Aslan
Mayor Coral J. Evans
Councilmember Jamie Whelan
Councilmember Jim McCarthy
Councilmember Charlie Odegaard
Councilmember Regina Salas
Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni**

1. Call to Order

Mayor Evans called the Joint City/County/NAU Work Session of April 1, 2019, to order at 4:03 p.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

Councilmember Salas led the Council and audience in the Pledge of Allegiance and Councilmember Odegaard read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. Roll Call:

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers/Supervisors may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

CHAIRMAN BABBOT
VICE CHAIRWOMAN FOWLER
SUPERVISOR ARCHULETA
SUPERVISOR PARKS (arrived at 4:12 p.m.)
SUPERVISOR RYAN (arrived at 4:21 p.m.)

MAYOR EVANS
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

PRESIDENT CHENG

Others present: City Manager Barbara Goodrich, City Attorney Sterling Solomon, County Manager James Jayne

4. **Public Participation:**

Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an items that are not on the agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment on an item that is on the agenda is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak.

None.

Chairman Babbott asked to take a moment to reflect on the Flagstaff community because of recent events. He worked in conjunction with Mayor Evans to create a list of Flagstaff values. Mayor Evans and Chairman Babbott gave a summary of their thoughts on what Flagstaff's values are and led the meeting in a moment of reflection and silence at 4:08 pm.

5. **[Update on 2020 Census efforts of the Coconino County-Flagstaff Census team](#)**

Director of Special Initiatives and the Census Coordinator for Coconino County Kim Musselman led a presentation on the 2020 Census with City of Flagstaff Comprehensive Planning Manager and Census Coordinator Sara Dechter and Associate Director of NAU School of Communication Jerry Thull. She started the presentation by highlighting the census timeline. April 1st is the National Census Day of Action. Various partners have joined to advertise the National Day of Action via social media. The Census bureau's tagline is "Shape your Future." Census job recruitment has started and has received 200 applications for early operations positions. There will be 1,400 total positions for the complete rollout.

The citizenship question will be heard by the US Supreme Court on April 23, 2019. The Flagstaff office should open late July/early August in the old Walgreen's building.

The County received the Participant Statistical Areas Program (PSAP) data at the end of January. The County is the entity responsible for providing the PSAP data back to the Census Bureau. The PSAP data is where track boundaries, block groups, and other special designated places are determined. Many groups are looking at the data to make suggestions for changes and for accuracy. Letters were sent from the County to all towns and municipalities inviting them to participate. The information received from them will be entered into the software system in the next month and forwarded to the Census department in May. The City of Flagstaff has already submitted their data.

Councilmember Whelan asked Ms. Musselman to explain tracks. Ms. Musselman explained that every area in Coconino County is divided into tracks based off populations and physical location. The tricky part is that tracks need to follow geography so geographic information systems are very important in the process.

Ms. Musselman continued the presentation and gave an update on the Census Oversight Committee. The Committee meets quarterly and accounts for the resources

that are used for the Census. The first meeting was in February 2019 and determined that the committee will review events and purchases greater than \$2,500. They held interviews for a part-time Volunteer and Event Coordinator and have approved hiring a public relations and media firm.

They also approved submitting quarterly spending reports from the City and County so the oversight committee can review.

Ms. Dechter assumed the presentation. She stated that there was a press briefing broadcasted on YouTube. She reminded the group that there are two components to the census: education and outreach. There are currently five subcommittees with the NAU and the Media and Outreach subcommittees currently operating, and the K-12 Education Network, the Non-governmental organizations, and Employers and Businesses subcommittees starting in Summer and Fall 2019. In testing, it was found that 52.3% of people filled out the census form without any advertising or prompting. Without any efforts, it is reasonable to expect a 50% return on the census. The goals of the subcommittees are to target hard-to-reach populations.

Ms. Dechter spoke about media and outreach and stated that the *Arizona Daily Sun* has started working on a series of census-related articles and a Census jobs social media campaign has had good organic reach. The committee is discussing radio outreach as well.

Councilmember Aslan asked if there is a strategy in outreach regarding the undocumented community and the sensitivity surrounding it. Ms. Dechter replied that there is a network of social service groups, faith-based groups, and social outreach groups that work with undocumented communities in general. They are holding off on messaging until the Supreme Court decision, but they hope to know more in early to mid-May. Social science research shows that there is a 20% less chance that Hispanic households will reply. Councilmember Aslan replied that 20% sounds like a huge potential impact.

Vice Mayor Shimoni offered that students are not using Facebook as much anymore and recommended that staff use other social media avenues.

Mr. Thull stated that he is teaching two sections of the capstone class working on the communication efforts for the Census. NAU students are counted as residents of Flagstaff for the Census. The students are working on their outreach presentations for a May 3, 2019 presentation at Coconino County. Their findings show that students are not sure what the Census is, that awareness of the Census is low, and that the mailer delivery is problematic since students do not check their physical mail often. The mailer is addressed to "head of household" which causes uncertainty about who the mailer is addressed to and the questions in the Census are difficult for student households to answer. The capstone project also found that students prefer to be counted at home and do not realize that they should be counted as Flagstaff residents. However, there were some positives found; students thought the most important issues that the Census addresses were equitable funding for social welfare and education funding. They also felt strongly about representation in the House of Representatives.

As far as communication to students was concerned, face-to-face communication was

found to be the most important outreach method with Instagram and Twitter being the best for social media. Snapchat was found to not be the best avenue.

President Cheng thanked NAU staff and Mr. Thull for the work.

Supervisor Archuleta and Councilmember Whelan read a proclamation regarding the National Census Day of Action.

6. [Update on Forest Health initiatives \(Greater Flagstaff area\).](#)

Wildland Fire Management Officer Paul Summerfelt gave an update on Forest Health, focusing on resilient forest and community protection activities that the three entities are working cooperatively on. Mr. Summerfelt explained that he would cover the Flagstaff Water Initiative Program and that Forest Restoration Director for Coconino County Jay Smith, Greater Flagstaff Forest Partnerships Coordinator Anne Mottek, and NAU ERI Professor Dr. Han Sup Han would also present.

The Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project was approved by Flagstaff voters in 2012 and is an investment in the future. The City has treated and thinned about 89% of the 2,150 acres identified for thinning. The State has completed 100% of the 1,035 acres identified, but there are 200 acres that have just been identified and the State will work on this area in the next ten days. The Navajo Nation owns a piece in the Dry Lake Hills. Work is ongoing and is about 42% complete. Work should be completed this summer. The federal land has three phases. Phase I, around the base of Mt. Elden, has been completed. Phase II, which is steep, is about 40% complete and work will continue throughout the summer. Another 1,400 acres will be addressed with stewardship contracts. Phase III, which incorporates 2,600 acres, will begin soon.

The work requires helicopter logging with heavy equipment and takes a lot of outreach. Hand crews from the Arizona Conservation Experience, the Arizona Conservation Corps, and the City are working hard.

The Climate Adaptation and Action Plan identified forest health as a large component of the plan and it will be incorporated into the forest health projects.

Mr. Summerfelt added that there are unique messaging opportunities at the present time. The first is that Supervisor Babbott is one of the co-chairs for the Four Forest Restoration Initiative. The second is with the Arizona Corporation Commission which is setting the regulations for using biomass for electricity.

Mr. Smith assumed the presentation and spoke about the Coconino County Industry Partnership and trying to find a vendor for the waste-wood due to multiple no-bids in 2018. The companies are unable to transport the cuttings after they are done so they are not able to bid. The partnership is discussing the reasons for the lack of bids. They met with Congressman O'Halleran to discuss ways to improve and increase the forest industry in Coconino County. Good Earth Power AZ/New Life Forest Products has new investors and have begun installation of a new mill in the Williams area. Joe Dirt Excavating has also begun the installation of a mill in the Williams area.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there were any examples of other communities who have encountered issues with disposing of waste-wood. Mr. Smith stated that there are other

counties who have the same issue and believes that the solution may be a subsidy, but they need to find a creative solution rather than a subsidy to get rid of the low-value product.

Mr. Smith introduced Ms. Mottek, Greater Flagstaff Forest Partnerships (GFFP) Coordinator, and she discussed the 2019 Wildfire Mitigation Award that the GFFP received at the Wildland-Urban Interface Conferences and the accomplishments that lead to the award. GFFP was established in 1996 and is one of the longest standing partnerships in the country. Ms. Mottek asked all GFFP members, past and present, to stand and be recognized.

Dr. Han presented on forest operations and biomass. He discussed the issues with leaving biomass in the forest. He also discussed the lack of markets for wood in western Arizona and some potential pilot projects for exporting wood chips to South Korea working with JA International, LLC. He stated that there are ideas and studies on processing the biomass in Flagstaff to increase the sale value. NAU ERI is working to develop and expand industry interest.

Councilmember Whelan asked why the development would be in Camp Navajo and should there be concern about particles with production, especially with astronomy. Dr. Han replied that Camp Navajo is being discussed because of the proximity to railway infrastructure. Hauling with trucks would be economically impractical. There is a lot of water at Camp Navajo and the location is conveniently located near the highway as well. The particulate matter would be mitigated by having it in a remote location and the observatory operation is being considered.

President Cheng commended the ERI staff and spoke about the collaboration.

Vice Mayor Shimoni inquired about the pilot program with the South Korean company and if they had done this program with other areas. Dr. Han stated that the company has worked with Georgia, Florida, and California. The cost is much less with Georgia and Florida than California due to shipping differences.

7. **Discussion of Facility Planning and Organizational Updates.**

Public Works Director Andy Bertelsen started the presentation and gave an overview of the City of Flagstaff's building inventory. He covered the construction efforts underway and discussed the airport expansion. He covered leasing partners and planning efforts. He mentioned the Veteran's Home that will be built on McMillian Mesa. He also mentioned that the sport fields opened today and that there is a lot of demand for space for youth sports activities.

Councilmember Aslan inquired about locations for the West Side Park that was mentioned in the presentation. Mr. Bertelsen stated that staff has identified some overflow from the Boulder Point Development, behind Staples.

Facilities Management Director for Coconino County Susan Brown gave a short overview of the County facility planning and the County's projects. She stated that they are very proud of the new medical examiner's facility and that there will be an open house on April 30, 2019.

Vice President for Capital Planning and Campus Operations at NAU Dan Okoli gave an overview of projects NAU is working on with NAIPTA. They are partnering to make the connection coming from Beluah into campus safer, to create connection sidewalks on McConnell Drive, and to build a new transit station. NAU worked with NAIPTA to find funding for the project through an FTA grant. He also discussed the partnership with NAIPTA to do a study to add an additional fourth entrance to NAU at the intersection of Milton Road and Arizona State Route 66.

Councilmember Whelan inquired about the potential traffic impact of the development of a new entrance at Route 66 and Milton. Mr. Okoli stated that he believes that the new entrance would improve traffic in the area and he is working with a consultant on traffic flow, potentially incorporating a traffic signal. They are exploring if the entrance will be a limited entry or restricted entry. The impact analysis will allow for recommendations. The consultant is also exploring closing some of the access points that exit onto Milton.

The other projects Mr. Okoli spoke about are to examine the utilization and appropriateness of spaces for current and desired methods of teaching, research learning, and student life; identify programmatic needs to support the university's mission; and developing a set of recommendations to improve and enhance spaces to meet programmatic needs and overarching goals. This allows for NAU to be good stewards and partners. There is a renovation of the third and fourth floors on the Science Annex Building to convert them into offices. They are selecting consultants for the STEM Building to be occupied in 2023. The Student Athlete High Performance building has had a consultant picked and that building will be completed in 2021.

Vice Mayor Shimoni mentioned that he was looking forward to the progress.

8. **Transportation discussion including; City's 5 Year Plan highlights; Multi-Modal coordination; NAIPTA coordination; County coordination and; NAU coordination.**

City Engineer Rick Barrett presented on the following topics: the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan; the City Transportation Commission; the City's Five-Year Plan including the Lone Tree overpass and the Mill Town project that extends Beulah Boulevard; the Multi-Model project; the Master Plan regarding the missing sidewalk connections; dedicated bike pedways off roadway; updates on the Arizona Department of Transportation; Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization; the Lone Tree Traffic Interchange, NAU project highlights; FUSD projects; and BNSF Railway.

CEO and General Manager of NAIPTA Erika Mazza highlighted the successes of Mountain Line and future partnership opportunities. She highlighted an award from Arizona Department of Transportation on the Highway 180 implementation plan partnership. Ms. Mazza added that the Census data could allow for additional funding for NAIPTA.

President Cheng left the meeting at 6:02 pm.

Coconino County Deputy County Manager and Public Works Director Lucinda Andreani highlighted the projects that the County has completed. They were able to leverage funds due to Proposition 403 on the Lake Mary Road corridor, which has become an international destination for recreation. She also covered upcoming projects. Ms. Andreani addressed the future plans of the County regarding transportation including

working with consultants, equipment replacement, and future employment growth and culture.

Vice Mayor Shimoni addressed the widening of roads and how that is beneficial to the community.

Councilmember Aslan inquired about a pedestrian bridge or underpass to connect the Lake Mary area to campus. He feels that is an area that has a need for an alternative transportation route to allow for safety. Mr. Barrett responded that staff will look into that area.

Councilmember Whelan addressed the sidewalk connections and asked about the funding of those sidewalks. Mr. Barrett stated that sidewalk segments will be prioritized and the ability to expense them with other projects will be investigated. That program has not been built yet and the information will be available in the future. Proposition 419 starts in July.

Councilmember McCarthy inquired about the improvements to the Amtrack station and if that would impact the length of time the train stops and closes intersections. Mr. Barrett stated that it would not greatly impact the length of stay because of the way the station is built and the fact that the station is used for freight and passengers.

Supervisor Ryan addressed the improvements with transportation in the area and how investment has greatly improved transportation in the area.

Chairman Babbott inquired about the Lone Tree Traffic Interchange. Mr. Barrett stated that it is the same DCR which was never completed. It was an \$84 million-dollar price tag and the map presented is too small to see in detail. Mr. Barrett would be happy to bring this forward in the future. There is considerable work dedicated to I-40 in that cost estimate that is not included in the traffic interchange.

9. Public Participation

This item was taken out of order.

This item was moved to 5:36 pm so that President Cheng could leave the meeting at 6:00 pm due to a conflicting meeting.

President Cheng presented the Mayor and the County Supervisor Chair a new Northern Arizona University flag. She also distributed a flyer regarding parking, transportation, and growth. She addressed the growth at NAU and spoke about the drive of Arizona to have 60% of residents obtain a college degree. President Cheng stated that 12,000 NAU alumni live in the Flagstaff region.

10. Informational Items To/From Chairman, Supervisors and County Manager/Mayor, Council and City Manager/NAU President

Councilmember Salas shared that she traveled to Washington D.C. with Mayor Evans, Councilmember Whelan, City Manager Goodrich, and Deputy City Manager Dille. She spoke about the requests the City made.

Supervisor Parks stated that he traveled to Washington D.C. as well and that they had

productive sessions with the representatives. He was also able to go to the White House and stated that Chair Babbott was very influential with the congressional representatives.

Councilmember Odegaard shared his gratitude for having all participants at the meeting and thanked the partners for being in attendance.

Supervisor Fowler thanked NAU and stated that they recently completed a study on the North Rim regarding opening and closing dates and the economic impact. It was found that if the North Rim was open one month longer there would be a positive economic impact of \$14 million dollars. Supervisor Fowler's district does not touch Flagstaff and it is the only one that does not.

Supervisor Ryan stated that he looks forward to working with the City Council and welcomed the new Councilmembers.

Councilmember McCarthy gave his thanks for the consideration given at the meeting.

Supervisor Archuleta expressed her gratitude and stated that the agenda was meaningful to her. She also welcomed the new Councilmembers and recognized President Cheng and thanked her for her visibility and her communication. She stated that she is excited about the Milton Road study.

Vice Mayor Shimoni also expressed his gratitude to all the participants and organizers of the meeting. He stated that he feels that everyone works best when working together.

City Manager Goodrich also expressed her gratitude and spoke about the meeting with Congressman Stanton in Washington D.C. where he spoke about how when dealing with all the background noise, you will miss the great things happening around us. Ms. Goodrich stated that meetings like these allow for the discussion of the great projects happening in the Flagstaff area.

Dr. Okoli expressed his gratitude and stated that NAU is proud to be a part of the partnerships.

County Manager Jimmy Jayne stated his thanks.

Chairman Babbott thanked Flagstaff City Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen and past Economic Vitality Director Stacey Button for the success with the new airline. He also addressed the work done on Mental Health First Aid and suicide in the community. He updated the group on the Ft. Tuthill Water Corridor challenges.

Mayor Evans thanked the County Supervisors and President Cheng for attending the meeting and the staff from all three organizations.

11. Adjournment

The Flagstaff City Council, Coconino County Board of Supervisors, and Northern Arizona University Joint Work Session of April 1, 2019, adjourned at 6:33 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK