Planning and Zoning Commission
Staff Review Board Agenda
Meeting of September 25, 2019-3:00 PM to 4:00 PM
Board of Supervisors Meeting Room

Study Session Agenda
Meeting of September 25, 2019-4:00 PM
Board of Supervisors Meeting Room
County Administrative Center
219 East Cherry Avenue
Flagstaff, Arizona

The following applications are scheduled for a public hearing on Wednesday, October 30, 2019. At the Study Session, Commissioners will briefly discuss these cases:

1. Case No. CUP-19-037: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a recreational vehicle to be used as a residence on a 2.35-acre parcel in the AR (Agricultural Residential, one-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located on Cienega Drive a short distance west of Double A Ranch Road and approximately three miles north of Ash Fork. It is also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 206-26-018C.
   Property Owner: Timothy Yobst, Ash Fork, AZ
   Applicant: Lori McElwain, Ash Fork, AZ
   County Supervisor District: 1 (Art Babbott)

2. Case No. CUP-19-038 and DRO-19-003: A request for a Conditional Use Permit and Design Review for the installation of water storage tanks and a pump house (utility installation) on a .12-acre portion of a 70.18-acre parcel in the RR 2 ½ (Rural Residential, 2 ½-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The site is located on Taylor Springs Ranch Road in Fort Valley and is also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 300-63-037A.
   Property Owner: Cygnus SBL Peaks, LLC, Ash Fork, AZ
   Applicant: N. Emery Layton, Flagstaff, AZ
   County Supervisor District: 1 (Art Babbott)

3. Case No. CUP-19-039: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for short term rental cabins (hotel/motel) on a 1.65-acre parcel in the CG-10,000 (Commercial General, 10,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located at 5460 N Sunset Strip in Red Lake and also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 202-07-016.
   Property Owner: Carey Enterprises, Inc, Prescott, AZ
   Applicant: Jeff Fox, Gilbert, AZ
   County Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)
Community Development Department Update
1. The County and Arizona Game and Fish hired Jessica Simmons as the new Urban Wildlife Planner, she starts on September 24th.
2. Adam Hicks was selected at the Community Development Department Interim Building Official, he previously served as the Lead Building Inspector.
3. Arizona APA awarded the County and JLUS partners an honorable mention award for the JLUS in the Comprehensive Plan 50,000 and over category.

Board of Supervisors Update
4. On September 24th the Board appointed Verlin Joe to the Planning and Zoning Commission from District 5.
5. On October 8th the Board will hold a public hearing on the Bellemont Area Plan.

Commission and Staff Roundtable
Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission
Agenda

Meeting of September 25, 2019–5:30 PM
Board of Supervisors’ Meeting Room
County Administrative Center
219 East Cherry Avenue
Flagstaff, Arizona

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Planning and Zoning Commission and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the Planning and Zoning Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the Commission’s attorneys on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A) (3). Items may be taken out of the order listed below at the call of the Chair.

I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

August 28, 2019

III. PUBLIC HEARINGS

4. Case No. PZ-AM-19-003: An amendment to the Coconino County Zoning Ordinance, to include modifications, updates and revisions throughout the entire code including all of Chapters 1 through 6, adding the Bellemont Area Plan to the Design Review Overlay section, and adopting a new format and style with the updated Ordinance.

5. Case No. CUP-19-034 and DRO-19-002: A request for a Conditional Use Permit and Design Review for a truck yard on a 14-acre portion of a 17-acre parcel in the M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial, 6,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located at 7201 Leupp Road approximately two miles north of Townsend-Winona Road and is also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 303-41-04B.
   Property Owner: Flagstaff Auto Recyclers, Flagstaff, AZ
   Applicant: FedEx Freight, Inc, Harrison, AR
   Representative: Kathy Simon
   County Supervisor District: 4 (Jim Parks)

6. Case No. CUP-19-035: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a church on a 10-acre parcel in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located on W Route 66
approximately 600 feet east of the intersection with Flagstaff Ranch Road and is also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 116-04-016.

Property Owner: N and J Properties VII, LLC, Tucson, AZ
Applicant: Grace Community Church, Flagstaff, AZ
Representative: Brian Ketter
County Supervisor District: 1 (Art Babbott)

7. Case No. CUP-19-036: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a community health center on a 29.97-acre parcel in the G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located at 15645 Leupp Road approximately four miles west of Indian Route 70 and is identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 303-25-003R.

Property Owner/Applicant: Katherine Hawke, Flagstaff, AZ
County Supervisor District: 4 (Jim Parks)

IV. CALL TO PUBLIC FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

V. CONTINUATION OF STUDY SESSION IF NEEDED
Coconino County Planning and Zoning Commission  
Meeting of August 28, 2019  
Board of Supervisors' Meeting Room  
County Administrative Center  
219 East Cherry  
Flagstaff, Arizona

Members Present
Tammy Ontiveros – Madame Chair  
Don Walters – Vice Chair  
Sat Best  
Ray Mayer  
John Ruggles  
Tyanna Burton  
Mary Williams  
Jim Clifford

Members Absent

Staff Present
Jay Christelman, Director  
Jess McNeely, Assistant Director  
Bob Short, Principal Planner  
Zach Schwartz, Sr. Planner  
Aaron Lumpkin, County Attorney  
Marty Hernandez, Recording Secretary

Madame Chair Ontiveros called the meeting to order at 5:31PM. She noted procedures to the audience.

I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

July 31, 2019

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made the motion to approve the minutes once the typographical error was corrected.  
SECOND: Commissioner Williams seconded.  
ABSTAINED: Commissioner Walters abstained.  
DISCUSSION: NA  
VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

III. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Case No. AM-19-002: A Minor Amendment to the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan and Coconino County’s adopted version of the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030,
Place Matters, to adopt the updated Bellemont Area Plan. This case was continued from the June 26, 2019 hearing.

STAFF: Mr. McNeely gave a PowerPoint presentation. Mr. McNeely asked the people that have worked on the plan to stand and be recognized. Mr. McNeely summarized the Plan and recommended that the plan be approved with the minor amendments to the Comprehensive plan, which are to adopt the updated Bellemont Area Plan as a Minor Amendment to the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan with revisions to policies LU.1 and NE.22 and to adopt the Design Review Overlay guidelines and to adopt a Minot Amendment to the Coconino County version of the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030, Place Matters, to amend the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 Future Growth Illustration Map.

APPLICANT: NA

PUBLIC: No one from the public spoke.

COMMISSION: All commissioners support the plan and the policy changes.

MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made the motion to approve AM-19-002 as follows: To recommend approval of PZ-AM-19-002, the Bellemont Area Plan, with suggested policy changes to LU.1 and NE.22 as written in this report, to the Board of Supervisors and to include the following minor amendments to the Comprehensive Plan:
1. To adopt the updated Bellemont Area Plan as a Minor Amendment to the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan, with staff recommended revisions to policies LU.1 and NE.22, and to adopt Design Review Overlay guidelines.
2. To adopt a Minor Amendment to the Coconino County version of the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030, Place Matters, to amend the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 Future Growth Illustration Map.

SECOND: Commissioner Mayer seconded the motion.

DISCUSSION: NA

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

2. Case No. CUP-19-032: A request for a Conditional Use Permit for a 4,000 sq. ft accessory structure on a 2.05-acre parcel in the RS-40,000 (Residential Single-Family, 40,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone. The property is located at 11715 Homestead Lane in Timberline and is identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 301-87-015A.

   Property Owner: Clarence and Susan Collins Revocable Trust, DTD, Flagstaff, AZ
   Applicant: Clarence Collins, Flagstaff, AZ
   County Supervisor District: 2 (Elizabeth Archuleta)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation and stated staff could make the findings with recommendations of the four conditions stated in the staff report.

DISCUSSION: Commissioner Ruggles stated that his wife was the only one to attend the neighborhood meeting. He wanted to disclose that information. He thought it would not have been appropriate for him to be at the neighborhood meeting.

APPLICANT: Clarence Collins of Flagstaff, AZ. Mr. Collins agreed with the staff report.

PUBLIC: NA
COMMISSION: All commissioners could make the findings.
MOTION: Commissioner Ruggles made the motion to approve CUP-19-032 with conditions as recommended by staff.
SECOND: Commissioner Williams seconded the motion.
VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

3. Case No. ZC-19-006: A request for a Zone Change from G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size) Zone to M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial, 6,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size) Zone on a 64.62-acre parcel. The parcel is located approximately ½ mile south of the Newman Park exit on Interstate 17 and is also identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 400-13-001.
Property Owner/Applicant: Morrison Brothers Windmill Ranch, LLC, Gilbert, AZ
Representative: Gregory Bamford, Gilbert, AZ
County Supervisor District: 3 (Matt Ryan)

STAFF: Mr. Short gave a PowerPoint presentation. He stated that this zone change was speculative, and a specific development plan was not proposed.
DISCUSSION: Commissioner Williams asked if the zone change occurred, how does it affect the flood plain. Mr. Short said this was an unstudied floodplain and the elevations have not been determined. If no development is proposed in the floodplain, a study is not required. Commissioner Ruggles asked about a Zone Change versus a CUP. Mr. Short said the if the Commission moved forward with the Zone Change then it would go forward as a Zone Change. Mr. McNeely indicated that, if the Zone Change was not approved, the applicant could apply for a CUP or TUP The Applicant could apply immediately for a CUP or TUP; there would be no waiting period. Commissioner Ruggles asked about other uses for the M-2-6000 Zone. Mr. Short stated there are many uses but there is a definition in Condition # 1 for this zone change request and he tried to pattern this zone change request after the updated zoning ordinance and the conditions for use are stated in the staff report. Commissioner Best was concerned about uses but Mr. Short stated that only the uses in the staff report are recommended, not the uses in the M-2-6000 Zone. Mr. Short stated that typically in a Zone Change the applicant has the availability of all the uses but this one has conditional zoning. Commissioner Burton asked about parcel size and if it could be split. Mr. Short said that 6,000 was a small area, it could be split but that would be too small for forest service products processing. Commissioner Ruggles stated that if the Commission forwarded the recommendation to the Board of Supervisors, it seems like the Board of Supervisors would determine the use and add a time period. Mr. Short stated Commission could put a time period on conditional zoning.
APPLICANT: Greg Bamford, 325 S. Higley Rd., Ste. 110 Gilbert, AZ, 85296, gave the background of property. He was tasked with finding the best use for this property. He looked at many different avenues and the forest restoration idea
seemed like an idea that could serve the purpose. This is a safety restoration project for the greater good of the people and the land. Industry is attracted to
land that is zoned and ready to go. He asked that serious consideration be given
to advance this to the Board of Supervisors. A well was drilled in 2007 that can
produce up to 200/gal /min. which could handle whatever might be developed on
the land. Mr. Bamford passed around Flagstaff Industrial Comparisons in
Coconino County, which is a summary of comparisons of industrial lands for sale
in the area compiled by Co-Star LoopNet. A potential user will know what they
have to work with and will be more attracted to a permanently zoned property.
Mr. Bamford stated they agreed with the conditions stated. A neighborhood
meeting was held and was well attended.

COMMISSION: Commissioner Walters indicated the applicant’s ancestors had
the property, and he had developed nearby Foxboro Ranch Estates along with
other background information. Commissioner Walters stated this property is not
appropriate for commercial or heavy industrial. He indicated the Morrison
brothers he knew would not support this industry on this property.

Richard Morrison, 720 West Elliott Gilbert, AZ 85233. A user came to us with a
plan and a contract. The details were worked out and were waiting to sign the
contract. They believe the flood plain could be mitigated. Mr. Morrison did not
know about the Forest Service plan until a few weeks ago. He recognizes this is
a beautiful piece of property. Good stewardship is putting this land to use to be
useful to the community.

Commissioner Walters suggested a Forest Service exchange, but Mr. Morrison
stated he had worked with them for over 14 years. It takes many years but that
does not seem to be happening. Commissioner Walters asked about working
with State Land for an exchange. Richard has not worked with them yet.
Commissioner Walters is willing to work with them and help them if interested.

Chair Ontiveros stated commission had to support 3 findings. How would the
proposal protect the scenic corridor? Mr. Bamford stated the buildings could
blend with the environment and the view of the Peaks would not be obstructed.
Chair Ontiveros stated there are other properties that could serve this purpose and
doesn’t feel the comparison sheet is complete. Madame Chair stated that the
Comprehensive Plan supports developing existing industrial areas. Mr. Bamford
stated all products would be forestry and forestry related. We are limiting to
forest related industry.

Commissioner Williams asked about putting a time frame on this? If this goes
beyond 3 years-what will change? Mr. Bamford said the current project is for 20
years.

Commissioner Clifford asked if the representative from Coconino National Forest
had gotten back to Mr. Morrison. Mr. Morrison stated the documents have been
returned. He stated they are complicated and time consuming.

Commissioner Clifford asked if there had been discussion regarding upgrading
Forest Service Road 772. Mr. Bamford said the Forest Service contact is
researching delineation of road, knows it needs to be upgraded and maintained
regarding industrial zoning. Commissioner Clifford think the zone change was
speculative since Forest Service had not approved of upgrading the road first.
He said he could not move forward on speculation. Chair Ontiveros said there are two ways to accomplish what they are wanting by either a Zone Change or a CUP/TUP, and asked Why is the CUP/TUP avenue not being used? Mr. Bamford thought the position would be stronger for industry if zoning was approved and the wording: conditional or temporary would be determinantal to future industry that might want to participate or buy into development of the property.

Mr. McNeely said that if the Zone Change was denied, the applicant could not come back as a zone change for one year but could come back as a TUP or CUP. Commissioner Best asked Mr. Bamford if he would consider a delay to form a better plan then come back for another hearing. He thought it was a good idea to take a step back and review and continue until later.

Mr. Bamford asked for a 90-day continuance, until the December 4th hearing. Commissioner Ruggles thought it was only fair to let him know concerns and thoughts expressed so he knows what they are looking for in the future.

PUBLIC: Tom Piffer, 8999 N Bel Air Rd., Casa Grande, AZ, said he had sold this property to the Morrison Brothers. He wrote a letter regarding his concerns about the water possibly running on his property and the beauty of the corridor being ruined.

Cindy Eagleton, 17550 Munds Ranch Rd., Munds Park, AZ, feels it would be a very negative impact for the area. The beauty would be taken away from the gateway to Flagstaff. She felt like this would be very detrimental to the county.

Mr. Bamford has worked 15 years to find use for this land. He asked Commissioner Walters to help him work with Forest Service or State Land to find use.

Commissioner Williams asked for clearer picture on floodplain mitigation.

Commissioner Ruggles believes industrial use is not right for this area, nor for a conditional use or TUP. He referred to the Zoning Ordinance regarding these.

Commissioner Walters indicated this property is not appropriate for these large-scale forest products uses and he cannot make the findings. He indicated that the Morrisons are a great family.

Commissioner Best stated burns are inevitable.

Commissioner Mayer stated anything he added would be redundant. This gateway is beautiful and will not approve to butcher it.

Commissioner Burton had the same thoughts as the other commissioners.

MOTION: Commissioner Williams made the motion to continue for 90 days to 12/4/2019.

SECOND: Commissioner Ruggles seconded it.

VOTE: The vote was unanimous.

IV. CALL TO PUBLIC FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

No one from the public spoke.
V. CONTINUATION OF STUDY SESSION IF NEEDED

Mr. McNeely made everyone aware of items on the study session for the next hearing. Staff will be going to the APA conference will be on September 11-13, 2019. Commissioners were invited. Community Development was interviewing interim certified building officials. There were two internal applicants. Urban Wildlife interviews were held and should decide within the week.
On August 6, the BOS reappointed Commissioners Ontiveros, Ruggles, Mayer, and Williams. Mr. McNeely thanked Tammy Ontiveros for stepping up to be chair and Don Walters to be vice-chair.
Supervisor Lena Fowler has found a new commissioner, Verlin Joe. He will be appointed on by BOS on September 24. He will try to sit in on the next hearing to observe.
The Board of Supervisors approved all cases that were on the P&Z hearing last month. Commissioner Best asked about attending by Skype. Mr. McNeely stated attendance by phone is acceptable per the by-laws.
Mr. McNeely talked about the new King Street building for Community Development, along with other departments, with better technology.

Madame Chair Ontiveros adjourned the hearing at 8:10 pm.

Chairperson, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission

ATTEST:

Secretary, Coconino County
Planning and Zoning Commission
COCONINO COUNTY ARIZONA
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Jay Christelman, Director

Date: September 25, 2019
To: Planning and Zoning Commission
From: Community Development Department
Subject: Case No. PZ-AM-19-003 Public Hearing and Consideration of Adopting an Amendment to the Coconino County Zoning Ordinance, to include modifications, updates and revisions throughout the entire code and including all Chapters 1 through 6, adding the Bellemont Area Plan to the Design Review Overlay section, and adopting a new format and style with the updated Ordinance.

Executive Summary

Location: The Zoning Ordinance applies across the entirety of Coconino County
Supervisor District: ALL
Applicant: Coconino County Community Development

Summary of the Zoning Ordinance Update:

In June 2017, the Coconino County Board of Supervisors initiated a comprehensive update to the Coconino County Zoning Ordinance. Managed internally by County Planning and Zoning staff, this update has been informed step by step by the Community Development Advisory Group (CDAG), a Technical Advisory Group, the Planning and Zoning Commission during study sessions, and the Board of Supervisors during work sessions.

THE FOCUS OF THIS UPDATE IS TO:

- Facilitate ongoing implementation of the Comprehensive Plan.
- Modernize the six-chapter code by reviewing land uses for those that are obsolete or unused, introduce new land uses to reflect changing trends, and update the definitions.
- Review land uses that currently require conditional-use permits for those that, due to changed conditions and new performance standards, may be administratively permitted instead, meaning that these land uses may be permitted with an administrative and/or a building permit.
- Clarify and improve performance standards to guide design requirements for several new and updated uses.
- Increase performance standard flexibility to accommodate differences among areas throughout the County, such as adding cacti to the landscape ordinance plant list for appropriate climate zones.
- Streamline and clarify administrative processes, such as expanding waiver criteria for administrative adjustments.

NEW CODE FORMAT

- New, updated format style with section headers, footers and colors.
- Consistent and corrected section numbering.
- Continuous page numbering throughout.
- New and updated graphics.
- Electronic document links to aide on-line navigation.
- Industrial zone titles and abbreviations are changed from M to I.

MAJOR CHANGES SUMMARIZED BY CHAPTER

This comprehensive update to the zoning ordinance includes changes throughout the entire six-chapter Code, described in detail in Exhibit B, “Summary of Major Changes”.

Background Information

A specific process was created to inform this update throughout the 24-month process. Those process steps, public engagement strategies that were used to generate and capture public comment, and future code updates are summarized in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROCESS</th>
<th>Step 1: Staff edits chapter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EACH CHAPTER WAS UPDATED</td>
<td>Step 2: Technical Advisory Group review and comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOLLOWING THIS SEQUENCE</td>
<td>Step 3: Community Development Advisory Group (CDAG) review and comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Step 4: Planning and Zoning Commission study session review and comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Step 5: Board of Supervisors work session review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Step 6: Feedback loop back to CDAG with changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Step 7: Continuous and ongoing code updates – post-adoption (see below)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES USED THROUGHOUT PROCESS

- CDAG agendas and materials posted on Planning and Zoning Department webpage
- Technical Advisory Group meeting agendas posted on webpage
- Planning Commission and Board of Supervisors work and study sessions posted on all agendas throughout the update process
- July 2019 Open House with 16 attendees from a variety of interest groups
- Open House flyer sent to 500+ email distribution list, and posted on webpage
Staff Report
Case No. PZ-AM-19-003
Page 3

Notice (custom flyer) of Planning Commission Public Hearing and link to draft
document sent to 500 + distribution list, and posted on webpage
Utilized community engagement web service (Konveio) for public comment on draft
Press release notifying media about public hearings
Formal legal notice sent to Flagstaff, Sedona and Williams area newspapers

**FUTURE CODE UPDATES**

1. Lighting section update will be coordinated with the City of Flagstaff
2. Utility Scale Energy Ordinance
3. Sign Ordinance
4. Transfer of Development Rights (TDR) Ordinance

**Findings of Fact for Approval of Zoning Ordinance Amendments**

In order to approve an amendment to the zoning ordinance, the Planning and Zoning Commission must find that the proposed amendments meet the following three findings of fact:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning Ordinance Amendment Findings of Fact and Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. That the change is consistent with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan and this Ordinance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Analysis:* This zoning ordinance amendment meets many of the Comprehensive Plan goals, objectives and policies, as detailed in the section below.

The update also directly implements the Comprehensive Plan Action Item directing Community Development to “[update] the Zoning Ordinance to further implement the goals and policies of the Comprehensive Plan. To include, but not be limited to, energy component, design standards, streamlined process, and enhanced zoning districts”. This update addresses *design standards* in new performance standards for specific uses, and updated standards for temporary uses, accessory dwellings, cottage industries; *streamlined processes* by changing conditional use permits required for some land uses to permitted land uses, adding a new process for administratively changing a planned district zone, updating types of administrative adjustments (including paving waivers); and *enhanced zoning districts* by consolidating redundant land uses, merging land use tables for ease of use, adding new land uses, clarifying and adding to performance standards, and significant updates to the landscape section that provides credit to retain existing vegetation.

2. That the change is in the interest of or will further the public health, safety, comfort, convenience and welfare.

*Analysis:* The amendment specifically responds to the interests and requests from community members, developers and land owners to update the zoning regulations. Such changes support public comfort and convenience in the addition of campgrounds as a land use to the General (G)
zoning district, and including mixed-use commercial as a new use in the commercial zones; safety concerns are addressed by adding the requirement that landscape plans address fire-wise standards and weed mitigation. Public health is addressed by used that support public transit and encouraging mixed-uses in concentrated activity centers that foster walking distances between residential and commercial uses. All the proposed amendments are intended to enhance the public health, safety, comfort, convenience and welfare of the entire Coconino County community.

3. That the change will not adversely affect the established character of the surrounding neighborhood nor be detrimental to adjacent properties.

Analysis: This amendment does not propose significant changes to the current established zoning districts rather, it is intended to enhance, support and improve the existing character of neighborhoods by allowing flexibility to account for variations in neighborhoods and communities throughout the County.

Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Analysis

To further address finding number one above, the following analysis outlines how the proposed zoning ordinance amendment complies with the Comprehensive Plan goals and policies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sustainability and Resiliency Goal:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Incorporate and support integrating the principles of sustainability and long-term community resilience and prosperity into future land use and development plans, as well as the actions and decisions of elected and appointed officials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis:</strong> The proposed amendment supports this goal by incorporating a new symbol throughout the document. This symbol that identifies sections that specifically promote sustainable development. In addition, waiver criteria for projections into required yards are updated to provide allowances for energy efficient and water catchment systems within setbacks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Natural Environment Goals:**                                               |
| • Protect the integrity and resiliency of the natural environment with special attention to environmentally sensitive features. |
| • Conserve wildlife, their habitats, and movement corridors.                  |
| • Conserve and restore native plant communities while controlling populations of invasive weeds through prevention and environmentally responsible eradication. |
| • Improve forest and land health and promote the restoration of forest ecosystems. |
| • Protect soil resources and improve soil conservation practices.             |
| • Improve the county’s air quality.                                          |
Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals

**Analysis:** The updates to the landscape section specifically address weed mitigation and retention of existing vegetation; a new land use “Forest Products Processing” specifically introduces a land use that promotes the processing of forest products in support of ongoing forest health initiatives.

**Water Resources Goals:**
- To pursue and implement long-term management policies that ensure sustainable water supplies for future generations and the natural environment.
- Ensure a sustainable water supply for human communities while protecting natural systems.
- Coordinate with state, federal, and local resource management agencies to ensure sustainable management practices that preserve and improve the quality of surface water and groundwater.
- Provide guidance to residents, water providers, and potential water districts to help them develop sustainable supplies that are consistent with local and regional needs.
- Promote water conservation practices that include new technologies and methods to reuse water.

**Analysis:** Manure management standards are added to Chapter 3, Agriculture and Animal Keeping, specifically to address water quality and runoff issues. Flexibility to the landscape irrigation standards promote use of gray water, water harvesting and region-appropriate design, and a waiver to landscape plan automatic irrigation requirements if an alternative means of irrigation is proposed such as manual watering, raingarden or permaculture design, has been added.

**Land Use and Growth Goals:**
- Respond to the specific and varied land-use conditions found in Coconino County with creative policies and strategies that protect important community values.
- Ensure the conservation of open space for the environmental, social, and economic wellbeing of the county.
- Conserve working ranches, unfragmented landscapes, and the county’s rural character.
- Ensure a range of housing choices in a variety of communities that are well designed in terms of character, natural environment, and availability of services.
- Ensure that commercial development is well designed and appropriately located within communities and activity centers.
- Increase creative and mixed land uses that result in self-sustaining communities and walkable and vibrant activity centers.
- Encourage the development of the industrial lands within the county, provided they are compatible with the policies of this Plan as sustainable employment centers, and maximize their strategic multimodal location.
Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals

- Minimize the impacts of public use / service land uses on the environment and community character.
- Concentrate development near existing infrastructure and services while conserving ecosystems and landscapes.
- Ensure that new development implements integrated conservation design practices.
- Coordinate capital improvements in a timely, orderly, and cost-effective manner.
- Ensure that every new development pays its fair share of costs associated with that development.

Analysis: Housing choices are expanded throughout the county by allowing all apartment construction as a permitted, versus conditional, land use, and by allowing recreational vehicles and travel trailers as permute residences with an administrative permit on conforming 10-acre parcels in the “G”, General zone. Currently these require a conditional use permit.

Mixed use development is encouraged to be located within activity centers, which in turn will encourage concentration of development new existing infrastructure. Residential uses are introduced as conditional uses in commercial zones that are outside of Area Plans and the Regional Plan boundary. Variety in housing choice is further supported by allowing Assisted Living, Convalescent Homes, Institutional Residential and Group Homes, Others as permitted land uses in the general and heavy commercial zones.

Industrial development is promoted by consolidating and simplifying redundant land uses, such as introducing three manufacturing categories using the term slight, medium and heavy manufacturing, and expanding light manufacturing to the commercial zones.

Community Character Goals:
- Develop well-designed communities that promote rural character and conserve open space and natural resources while enhancing quality of life and economic vitality.
- Support the development of concentrated commercial and community land uses that meet residents’ needs.
- Promote coordination of land use planning with sovereign tribal nations related to development and resource protection.
- Protect the county’s historic, cultural, and architectural heritage.
- Conserve local heritage areas, cultural landscapes, and open space.
- Conserve and enhance the integrity of the county’s scenic resources and unique features.
- Protect, conserve, promote, and enhance scenic corridors.
- The County shall continue to be a world leader in the preservation of dark skies.
- Preserve natural quiet and work to mitigate and reduce the effects of noise pollution.
Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals

Analysis: Community design was a primary consideration in crafting the new performance standards for campgrounds, recreational vehicles as a permanent residence, animal shelters and kennels, and Recreational Facilities, Outdoor. Decibel limits are introduced that apply to outdoor generators, and to kennel standards, will help to preserve natural quiet. Additions to the residential (RS) zones that allow decks and porches to project into front yards were specifically added to promote community connections and social gathering on small lots. The new mixed-use land uses allowed in commercial zones and encouraged in activity centers are intended to concentrate commercial and community uses. New graphics to illustrate the code standards will assist users in developing projects in compliance with the code.

The recently updated Bellemont Area Plan includes new Design Guidelines. These will become effective once the update to the zoning ordinance is adopted, as Bellemont is added to the list of area plans with design guidelines in Chapter 2, Overlay Zones (see Section 2.16.C.2.B).

The future lighting ordinance updates will further protect dark skies in the County.

Economic Development Goals:

- Create and maintain a sustainable standard of living and a high quality of life by recognizing the economic value of the natural systems and human capital within Coconino County. Through collaboration, continue to embrace economic, social, and environmental responsibility to build prosperous and livable places.
- Ensure that policies and regulations provide flexibility and support for emerging trends.
- Encourage and support business growth and sustainable business practices.
- Work with businesses to assess infrastructural needs and support improved infrastructure and systems throughout the county.
- Incorporate innovative planning techniques to encourage the development of compatible enterprises with neighboring land uses.

Analysis: The update was informed by emerging trends such as the need for promoting home occupations and cottage industries by expanding the conditional use of cottage industries into small lot RS zoning districts. To encourage and promote Neighborhood Commercial zoning throughout the County this zone is changed from two acres to one-half acre minimum parcel requirement.

The update also accounts for new design and manufacturing techniques that expand the range of design styles for housing. An allowance to permit manufactured homes to be used as accessory dwellings where those are allowed as primary dwellings, allowing recreational vehicles to be used as a permanent residence with an administrative permit, versus a conditional use permit, on G-zoned 10-acre parcels, and in manufactured home parks. However, some public comments disagree with this approach. See the public comment section.
The temporary use standards found in Chapter 3 have been modified to allow additional flexibility in the length, types and locations of temporary uses. These modifications support emerging economic trends for temporary events and uses such as seasonal sales lots and temporary food sales, including food trucks.

Parks, Open Space, Trails, & Recreation Goals:
- Plan for and provide a variety of recreational, cultural, historic, and educational opportunities throughout the county, in developed and future parks as well as natural areas.
- Provide for the conservation and stewardship of important natural areas and support the protection of other public lands that provide open space and recreation value.
- Enhance the existing regional system of trails by promoting more access and managed access between communities, public lands, and activity centers to create a network of linked open space, trails, and recreational areas.
- Build upon the cooperative opportunities between county, federal, and state agencies; sovereign tribal nations; cities; and private land managers to increase the outdoor tourism economy while conserving high-value natural and cultural resources in the county.

Analysis: The current zoning ordinance contains a mixed and somewhat confusing medley of recreational and park land uses. These were analyzed and recreation uses were consolidated into three major categories: Parks, Public or Private, Trails and Open Space; Recreational Facilities, Indoor; and Recreational Facilities, Outdoor. This was intended to simplify and clarify the uses between zoning districts to provide consistency and clarity for these uses. New performance standards for Recreational Facilities, Outdoor, provide consistent standards across zoning districts for these uses and were developed utilizing input from the Parks and Recreation Advisory Committee and Director. New performance standards introduced for Campgrounds and Recreational Vehicles Parks were informed by prior experience issuing conditional use permits for these uses.

Community Services Goals:
- Promote the installation of utilities in a manner that is compatible with community character, scenic resources, and ecological conditions.
- Promote telecommunications service development while preserving the visual character of communities and landscapes.
- Reduce solid waste, minimize the impact of its disposal, and support and encourage recycling.
- Implement best practices associated with wastewater technologies or management.
- Prioritize the health and wellness of residents and visitors.
- Advocate, coordinate, and collaborate to create and increase access to effective and affordable educational opportunities.
### Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals

**Analysis:** The current code of ordinance contains a robust provision for wireless telecommunication facilities. These standards have been slightly updated to include requirements for radar-activated safety lights for towers over 199' in height, adding sites in wildlife or migration corridors to the types of disfavored facilities, and standards for bird flight diverters on guy wires.

A new land use, Solid Waste Transfer Facility, is added as a conditional use to large lot residential, all commercial and the light and heavy industrial zoning districts to promote solid waste collection services and sites throughout the County.

Educational Institutions, a conditional use in all zoning districts, are to be issued use permits in perpetuity and are a permitted use when planned with a subdivision are conditional uses. Educational institutions are changed to permitted uses in Neighborhood and General Commercial, and industrial park zones.

**Public Safety Goals:**
- Ensure emergency services and response to meet residents' needs.
- Ensure safe, crime-free neighborhoods and communities.
- Provide for a high level of fire protection and safety.
- Reduce the threat of catastrophic wildfire in the W/UI.
- Avoid or mitigate the dangers posed by identifiable or predictable natural hazards.
- Maintain a high level of emergency preparedness to effectively respond to disaster and recovery efforts.

*Analysis:* Specific fire wise standards for new commercial, industrial and multi-family developments are proposed with the updated landscaping requirements. Fire stations, a conditional use in all zoning districts, are to be issued use permits in perpetuity and are a permitted use when planned with a subdivision. These changes promote public safety goals by ensuring that fire districts consider a community’s needs when siting a facility, while also providing a long-term commitment by the County to the fire district for the investment into site development and ultimately, to community safety.

**Circulation Goals:**
- Maintain a circulation network that is safe, efficient, and complementary to local communities and the environment.
- Improve rural and regional transit service opportunities.
- Explore opportunities for increasing air service for residents, tourism and freight while minimizing the impacts on surrounding communities and the natural environment.
- Improve nonmotorized circulation networks and provide greater opportunity for alternative modes of travel.
Zoning Ordinance Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan Goals

- Ensure the quality design and development of circulation systems that include both motorized and nonmotorized modes of transportation.
- Use best practices in the design and management of transportation infrastructure to minimize the impacts to soil, hydrology, and wildlife.
- Improve circulation infrastructure while protecting the environment and community character.
- Provide for safe travel and access to property.

Analysis: Rural and regional transit is encouraged by allowing a new land use, Transit Stop Center, as a permitted use in all zoning districts. Reduced parking standards are permitted when shared parking between uses is proposed. A performance standard has been added throughout all zoning districts to ensure that private roads and access easements are capable of supporting 42,000 pound emergency vehicles.

Energy Goals:
- Reduce energy consumption by increasing energy conservation and efficiency.
- Utilize wind and solar resources by encouraging distributed energy systems.
- Increase the use of technologies and strategies to reduce pollution, environmental degradation, and negative health impacts associated with energy production.

Analysis: A new use, Distributed (Individual) Renewable Energy Systems, is permitted across all zoning districts to encourage the installation of solar, wind and other alternative energy systems on individual parcels.

Public Comment

The draft zoning ordinance was posted for public comment on the Konveio public engagement website from August 16 to September 6, 2019. During this time five comments were received. Two comments asked if there is maximum size and number of accessory structures allowed on a parcel, one comment questioned why the County allows RV’s and travel trailers to be used as permanent residences, one comment queried if animal units are measured based on animal size, and questioned why there are stricter animal keeping performance standards for poultry than for livestock, and one comment questioned the standards that limit metal storage containers on large parcels to one container. See Exhibit A for the detailed comments and staff response to each.

Recommendation

Based on the above analysis staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission find that Zoning Ordinance Amendment PZ-AM-19-003 meets the three findings of fact necessary to approve an amendment, and forward PZ-AM-19-003 to the Board of Supervisors with a recommendation to adopt the proposed amendment to the Zoning Ordinance, as presented in Exhibit C.
Respectfully submitted,

Jess McNeely, AICP, Assistant Director

Prepared by Melissa Shaw, AICP, Long Range Planner

Attachments

Exhibit A: Public Comments on draft ordinance

Exhibit B: Summary of Major Changes to Coconino County Zoning Ordinance

Exhibit C: Website link to the draft updated Coconino County Zoning Ordinance: https://www.coconino.az.gov/DocumentCenter/view/30312/Coconino_County_Zoning_Ordinance_PlanningCommission-092519
## Exhibit A

### Public Comments on Draft Zoning Ordinance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code Section</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Staff Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Section 2.2.E.6 – Accessory Structures in the G, AR and RR Zones (page 20) | Is there a max size for accessory structures?  
Is there a max number of accessory structures allowed on a lot? | Currently, accessory structures over 3,000 SF require a CUP. The update proposes a change by permitting these in the G and AR zones, and allowing these with a CUP in all other residential zones. G zoned parcels smaller than two acres require a CUP.  
There is no limit to the number of accessory structures allowed on a lot however, maximum lot coverage standards do apply. |
| Section 2.7 Residential Zones Permitted and Conditional Uses Land Use Table (page 39) | Tiny homes were meant to provide low income families to build a less expensive home and still have the home be energy efficient comfortable. What is driving allowing RVs as homes, they are not designed to be full time homes.  
RVs don't exhaust moisture very well. Especially in the winter - a bathroom fan won't exhaust moisture unless a window is open for backup air. Will residents become hospital patients as a result of mold?  
When people get tired of living in an RV many move somewhere and leave it. There are abandoned RVs and trailers throughout Coconino County. Will we now condone it?  
Abandoned RVs become dilapidated over time and become rat infested, and potentially can become a hazardous waste site - oil, gas and decaying batteries. It's a cheap investment to leave behind. Maybe include a requirement that once the RV is no longer a permanent residence, it must be removed? | The County currently requires a CUP when an RV is proposed to be used as a permanent residence in the G or AR zones. This update proposes to allow RV's as a permanent residence on conforming G-zoned parcels with an administrative permit, subject to performance standards (a CUP is still required in the AR zone or non-conforming G zoned parcels). See Section 3.17, page 125 for the performance standards.  
The rationale for allowing RV's as a permanent residence derives from an interest in providing an array of housing options in the County, specifically from the Comprehensive Plan’s goal to: [e]nsure a range of housing choices in a variety of communities that are well designed in terms of character, natural environment, and availability of services. In an effort to balance this goal with the desire for well-designed communities, performance standards were drafted that attempt to mitigate some of the noise and safety issues identified by this comment. However, as proposed, the change from a CUP to “P” in the G zone may impact neighbors because the notice requirement for a public hearing is not required for an administrative permit. This may limit neighbor’s ability to comment prior to development. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code Section</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Staff Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| If the RV is off-grid, a septic and a minimum 1500 watt solar pv system for electricity should be required so they don’t need to run a generator full-time, especially in the winter. If it’s on grid, can they get an occupancy permit and connect to the grid?  
Why will anyone build a nice home off-grid in Zone G if they know an RV can show up next to them? We’re going to end up with a lot of RVs on rural land instead of sustainable homes. Is this really we want to do?  
Also see email comments.                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Shelters for animals must be permitted if they are over 200 square feet, unless the property owner participates in the “opt out” program.  
Animal units are counted based on individual species, not the size of an animal.  
Poultry may be kept on small residential lots in neighborhoods where homes are in close proximity. The limit is in consideration of noise.                                                                 |
| Section 3.3.D.1.F & G: Animal Keeping Performance Standards for Horses and Livestock and Poultry and Rabbits (page 99)                                                                                      | Are shelters required to be permitted if not a permanent structure?  
Does the county recognize animal units as in 1 horse or cow equals 5 adult sheep or goats?  
Why the tight limit on poultry when the limit is higher for large stock?                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Section 3.10.C.1.3.A Metal Storage Container Boxes Performance Standards Permanent uses in the G, AR, RR, RS, RM, RMH, and MHP Zones (page 112)                                                              | Why should someone with 20 times the land be held to having one 20-foot container? If someone has 1 acre and allowed a 20’ container, why should someone who has 40 acres also be limited to one 20’ container? |                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
Exhibit B

Summary of Major Changes

Chapter 1 General Provisions. This chapter acknowledges State enabling statutes that give authority to the zoning ordinance (ZO) and sets forth the purpose and intent of the code, including establishment of zoning districts, conformity of the ZO with the Comprehensive Plan, application, permit fees and requirements, and powers, duties and establishment of the Planning and Zoning Commission, Board of Adjustment, and Board of Supervisors (to the ZO).

Section 1.1 NEW Short Title and Authority section describes State statute granting authority for the County to establish a zoning ordinance.

Section 1.13 NEW Planning and Zoning Commission section describes powers, duties, membership, terms.

Section 1.14 NEW Board of Adjustment section describes powers, duties, membership and terms.

Section 1.15 NEW Board of Supervisors section describes powers and duties in relation to the ZO.

Chapter 2 Zoning Districts. This chapter describes the purpose, intent and use of all zoning districts, including permitted, conditional or prohibited land uses within each district, and the property development and performance standards that are specific to each district.

Section 2.2 General, Agricultural Residential, and Rural Residential Zones (G, AR, RR)

Conditional Uses (CUP) changed to permitted uses for:

- Bed and Breakfast
- Accessory Structures greater than 3,000 SF in G, AR, except parcels less than 2 acres require a CUP.
- Commercial Vehicle/Equipment parking in G, except parcels less than 10 acres require a CUP.
- Recreational vehicle as a permanent residence in G (requires an administrative permit)
- Educational Institutions, Fire Stations, Model Homes and subdivision sales offices and Parks, Trails and Open Space (when approved with subdivision plat)

NEW Land Uses added, or titles revised with NEW definitions for:

- Forest Products Processing as CUP in G, AR
- Community Centers, Recreational Facilities, Indoor and Recreational Facilities, Outdoor (NEW category out of “recreation facilities”)  
- Solid Waste Transfer Facility as CUP
- Transit Stop Center
- Campgrounds as CUP in G
- Kennel, Commercial as CUP in G, AR (reinserted)
- Distributed Renewable Energy Systems
Section 2.3 Single Family Residential Zones (RS)
Performance Standards are modified to allow first floor porches and decks to project up to 8 feet into front setback in RS 6,000, 10,000 and 18,000 zones.

Section 2.4 Multi-family Residential Zones (RM)
Conditional Uses changed to permitted uses for:
- Apartments are permitted and condensed into one category; previously five or more required CUP
- Condominiums and conversions, and conversion process substantially updated.

NEW Land Uses added, or titles revised with NEW definitions for:
- Duplex, townhouse

Property Development Standards modified to:
- Add minimum net site, lot width and depth area, and parking for SFD
- Clarify front, side, rear site setbacks for multi family units, SFD’s, duplex and ADU’s

Performance Standards modified to allow first floor porches and decks to project 8 feet into front setback.

Section 2.6 Manufactured Home Park Zone (MHP)
Conditional Uses changed to permitted uses for:
- RV’s as a permanent residence with administrative permit

NEW Land Use added to allow SFD as a caretaker/owner’s residence

Section 2.7 NEW consolidated Residential Zones Permitted and Conditional Land Use Table

Modified Performance Standards common to residential zones permit shower in Accessory Structure bathrooms.

Section 2.8 Commercial Zones
Conditional Uses changed to permitted uses for:
- Campgrounds & RV/Travel Trailer Parks in CG and CH, with administrative permit.
- Cocktail lounges and bars NOW Bars, Micro-breweries, Craft Distilleries, Wineries, Tasting and Tap Rooms; permitted in CG and CH; added as a CUP in CN.
- Hotels, Motels and Resorts in Commercial General zone.
- Restaurants, except with outdoor seating next to residential zone is a CUP.

NEW Land Uses added, or title revised with NEW definitions for:
- Forest Products Processing as CUP.
- Manufacturing, Light as a permitted use in CH and CG
- Mixed Use Development, in an activity center, as a permitted use
- Mixed Use Development, not in an activity center, as a conditional use
- Residential Uses outside of Area Plan and Regional Plan boundaries, as a CUP
- Park and Ride
- Parking Garages, Lot or Structure as CUP in CG, CH
Solid Waste Transfer Facility
Transit Stop Center

Performance Standards modified:

Screening between zones, landscaping and additional setbacks combined into NEW Section 4.8, Performance Standards Between Zones.

Section 2.9 Industrial Zones (abbreviations for Industrial changed from M to I)

Conditional Uses changed to permitted uses for:

- Manufacturing, Light

NEW Land Uses added, or title revised with NEW definitions for:

- Adult Use and Entertainment as CUP in IH (Heavy Industrial)
- Bars, Micro-breweries, Craft Distilleries, Wineries, Tasting and Tap Rooms as CUP.
- Forest Products Processing as CUP in IP (Industrial Park); permitted in IL and IH (Light and Heavy Industrial)
- Manufacturing, Light, Medium and Heavy. The three new categories consolidate many existing manufacturing uses, and many are changed from conditional to permitted.
- Motor Vehicle, boat and RV Storage are permitted in IL and IH.
- Park and Ride
- Parking Garages, Lot or Structure
- Solid Waste Transfer Facility
- Transit Stop Center

Performance Standards modified:

Screening between zones, landscaping and additional setbacks combined into NEW Section 4.8, Performance Standards Between Zones.

Section 2.10 NEW consolidated Commercial and Industrial Use Land Use Table.

Section 2.11 NEW Planned Districts, Special Purpose and Overlay Zones.

The existing RC, PRD and PC are consolidated into this NEW section, with common administrative requirements and performance standards grouped into this section.

Existing land use tables in the RC, PRD and PC zones are deleted, and the purpose statement of each planned districts is expanded. This change is intended to guide each planned development project toward the specific purpose of that district, versus listing a prescriptive set of specific land uses that may not anticipate the land uses appropriate for a specific project.

Section 2.12 Public and Quasi-Public is renamed from Public and Semi-Public

Section 2.13 Parking is DELETED

The parking zone is deleted with this update. It is an outdated zoning district that is actually a performance standard, versus a type of zoning. The listed land uses are incorporated into the remaining zoning districts, and as seen in the NEW land use definition of Parking Garage, Lot or Structure.

Section 2.14 Mineral Resource – No significant changes (formerly numbered Sec. 2.14).
Section 2.15 **NEW** consolidated Special Purpose Zones Permitted and Conditional Land Use Table.

Section 2.16 Overlay Zones - Floodplain Management and Design Review Overlay zones.

The Bellemont Area Plan is **NEW** to the listed Design Review Guidelines.

Updates include the types of modifications to approved Design Review Overly projects that are allowed with an administrative approval.

Use tables are deleted from the Floodplain Management Overlay zone, and minor text edits included.

Chapter 3 Special Uses and Conditions. This chapter provides special standards and conditions for specific uses that require greater attention to development standards. Special standards are provided for both commonly listed and permitted land uses, as well as land uses that require additional review and approval through the conditional use permit process.

Section 3.2 Temporary Uses.

Expanded temporary permit timeframe, operating hours and special event types for seasonal stables, holiday sales lots, temporary retail food sales, temporary occupancy of an RV or travel trailer (added RS 40,000 SF or larger), and storage of a mobile or manufactured home.

Section 3.3 Agriculture and Animal Keeping

Reorganized performance standards into sections for agricultural and animal keeping

Included performance standard for manure management

Added a definition for composting

Section 3.4 Accessory Dwellings

Performance standards allow manufactured homes as an ADU if permitted as a primary.

Expanded separation distance from primary from 60’ to 100’ for detached unit on lots less than 4 acres; from 100’ to 200’ on lots greater than 4 acres.

Updated waiver requirements to account for site and infrastructure constraints, such as location of wells, driveways and utilities.

Section 3.6 Cottage Industries

Number of employees may be increased from three to a number approved by the Planning Commission.

Expanded the use of Cottage Industries to all RS zones (currently only allowed in RS-36,000).

Added findings that are required to approve waivers for site access.

Section 3.7 Bed and Breakfast Establishments.

These are changed to permitted from conditional uses, and a provision for a sign is added.

Section 3.9 Wireless Telecommunication Facilities

Disfavored sites expanded to include sites in wildlife or migration corridors near a water source, and facilities with guy wires.

Radar-activated safety lights required for towers exceeding 199’

Standards for bird flight diverters required on guy wires are clarified.
Section 3.10 Metal Storage Container Boxes

Temporary container added: one 320 SF container in G, AR, RR and RS zones.
Permanent container added: one 160 SF container to RM, RMH and MHP zones.

Section 3.11 Accessory Wind Energy Systems
Performance standards for bird flight diverters are added.
Related - NEW use and definition for Distributed (Individual) Renewable Energy Systems.

Section 3.13 Nonconforming Uses
The title was modified to address only nonconforming uses.

Sections 3.14, Walls and Fencing, and 3.15, Storage and Screening MOVED to Chapter 4.

Section 3.15 NEW Recreational Facilities, Outdoor
This NEW section provides standards and a NEW definition for large outdoor facilities such as arenas, fairgrounds, amusement parks etc. It is a result of consolidating and updating the current code that contains a variety of recreation definitions and distinguishing between indoor and outdoor facilities.

Section 3.16 NEW Animal Shelters and Kennels, Commercial
This NEW section provides standards to address each type of use, including considerations that address noise for outdoor kennels, climate control and waste management.

Section 3.17 NEW Recreational Vehicles as a Permanent Residence
This NEW section outlines standards for RV's used as a permanent residence, with a CUP, such as wastewater disposal, permits needed for solid fuel burning appliances, and equipment screening.
RV's may be permanent residence in the G and MHP zone with an administrative permit.

Section 3.18 NEW Campgrounds and Recreational Vehicle Parks
Campgrounds are added as a conditional use on 10-acre parcels in the G residential zone, changed to a permitted use in Commercial zones, and to conditional use in Open Space zone.
NEW performance standards for all zoning districts where allowed, e.g. in commercial zones.

Chapter 4 Performance Standards. This chapter establishes performance, or development standards, that are commonly required for permitted and conditional land uses. Projects developing to these standards are reviewed either with an administrative, building or conditional use permit.

Section 4.1 Parking
The parking table standards have been updated and categories modernized.
An administrative waiver for paving and off-street parking requirements has been added with criteria.
Adjustments up to 20% of the number of off-street parking requirements, based on shared parking and site constraints, may be approved by the Director or Planning Commission.
Updated parking lot graphic.

Section 4.2 Signs
Wayfinding signs and a definition are added as exempt types.
Reorganized to differentiate between permanent and temporary signs.
Portable and sandwich board signs are **NEW** temporary sign allowed in commercial zones.
Updated and **NEW** graphics.

**Section 4.4 Landscaping**
This section applies to commercial, industrial, multi-family and single-family subdivision development, and there are significant updates to this section that address:
- Irrigation waivers
- Retention and protection of exiting native trees and shrubs, with landscape credit based on size for retaining existing trees.
- Landscaping units condensed from three to one plant unit, and cacti are permitted to be used in lieu of trees in appropriate climate zones.
- **NEW** waivers approved by Director for up to 20 percent of landscape requirements, with findings.
- **NEW** table consolidating landscape area requirements (parking lots, street frontage, building perimeter.)
- **NEW** section with specific standards to address fire protection and weed mitigation.
- **NEW** graphics.

**Section 4.5 Projections into Required Yards**
Separation between structure requirement is removed, reference is made to building code.
**NEW** projections for energy efficient improvements - cisterns, rain barrels, insulated walls.

**Section 4.6 Walls and Fencing is RELOCATED FROM CHAPTER 3**

**Section 4.7 Outdoor Storage and Associated Visual Screening is RELOCATED FROM CHAPTER 3 AND RENAMED**

**Section 4.8 **NEW** Performance Standards Between Zones**
This **NEW** section consolidates setback and screening requirements listed throughout Chapter 2 for commercial, industrial, public/quasi-public, commercial or highway commercial within residential zones, and mineral resource zones; redundant Chapter 2 sections deleted.

Chapter 5 Administration. This chapter details the permitting and approval requirements, processes and procedures for all types of planning permits and amendments to the zoning ordinance or Comprehensive Plan. Includes findings that are required for each permit type by each approving entity – the Planning and Zoning Commission, Board of Supervisors or Board of Adjustment. Procedures related to enforcement of the zoning ordinance and the duties of the zoning inspector and compliance manager are outlined.

**Section 5.3 Citizen Participation**
Section is reorganized to clearly distinguish between the citizen participation plan and report.
Section 5.6 Administrative Adjustments

Additional types of adjustments are allowed 20% increase in appurtenance height; 10% decrease in animal keeping setbacks and lot sizes, and lot size reduced for eminent domain.

NEW Section 5.6.C describes permits, findings and administration of these adjustments, including how to make a Minor Change to a Planned District Zone. This requires notification of the Planning and Zoning Commission when a request has been made.

Section 5.7 Conditional Use Permits

The types of conditions applicable to a decision of the Planning Commission is expanded to include protection for environmentally sensitive features, access from public rights of way, and requirements for public safety and emergency services.

Waiver findings are added for the Planning Commission.

Allowances for administrative renewals now include an increase in permit time frame.

Section 5.8 Variances

Board of Adjustment findings for approving a variance have been updated.

Section 5.13 Comprehensive Plan

A process for amending the Comprehensive Plan was added.

Chapter 6 Definitions. This chapter provides the adopted and official definition and meaning of the major land uses, zoning terms, documents and processes used throughout the zoning ordinance, and contains significant updates.

Section 6.2 Definitions

The definitions were reorganized to separate floodplain management overlay and lighting definitions from the main body of definitions.
Jay Christelman, Director

Date: September 25, 2019

To: Planning and Zoning Commission

From: Department of Community Development

Subject: Public Hearing and consideration of Case Number CUP-19-034 and DRO-19-002, a request for a conditional use permit and design review overlay for a freight truck relay yard

Executive Summary

Recommendation: Staff recommends approval of the conditional use permit and the design review overlay application with the recommended conditions.

Location: The parcel is located at 7201 Leupp Road in the Doney Park/Timberline/Fernwood Area Plan and is also identified as Assessor's Parcel Number 303-41-004B.
Size: 14 acres of a 17-acre parcel  
 Supervisor District: 4 (Jim Parks)  
 Current Zoning: M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial, 6,000 sq. ft. minimum parcel size)  
 Owner: Flagstaff Auto Recyclers, Inc, Flagstaff, AZ  
 Applicant: FedEx Freight, Inc, Harrison, AR  
 Representative: Kathy Simon

Background Information

Background

The auto recycling business previously located on this property dated to the early 1970s with a conditional use permit first being approved in 1973 for a period of 25 years (UP-73-10). In 1996, a use permit was requested for a 7,500 square foot building addition and associated upgrades (UP-96-34). The 1996 use permit was approved for a ten-year time period and was again renewed in 2006 for ten additional years. Changes in market conditions and local competition required the operation to close in July, 2014. Since that time, two CUPs have been approved for the site including a contractor’s yard (CUP-15-009) and a forest products processing business (CUP-17-018). Neither of these uses was established.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surrounding Land Uses/Zoning</th>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On Site</td>
<td>Warehouse</td>
<td>M-2-6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>Auto Recyclers</td>
<td>M-2-6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>Truss Manufacturers</td>
<td>M-2-6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>National Forest</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>Auto Recyclers, Vacant and Bulk Propane</td>
<td>M-2-6,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Natural Features**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topography</th>
<th>Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural Resources</td>
<td>Floodplain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Subject property showing the proposed entrance to the truck relay station
Proposed Development

Summary of Proposal

The applicant has submitted a narrative (Exhibit 1) describing the site and the proposed use along with a site plan, landscape plan, lighting plan, elevations, and illustrations of materials and colors, which are all included in the Commission packet. In addition to landscaping and lighting, the proposed improvements include security fencing, a modular building (break room and restroom facilities), an employee parking lot, truck tractor parking, and truck trailer parking. The site will serve as a location for freight drivers to park, switch trailers, park trailers and depart. The site will be open from 7 am until 6 pm and up to 91 employees will use the site. The property is impacted by the Special Flood Hazard Area Zone A. A study will be required to determine the 100-year Base Flood Elevation (BFE), and a floodplain development permit will be required prior to development of the site. A Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) prepared by a professional engineer will also be required for the proposed use and a right and center turn lane may be required for this use.

Citizen Participation

The applicant held a neighborhood meeting on the subject property on July 2, 2019. Two people attended the meeting and asked questions about the proposed operation. No concerns were expressed about the application. Staff has not received any comments on this application.
## Staff Analysis

### Compliance with the Comprehensive Plan

**Water Resources:**
8. The protection of surface water and groundwater quality shall be a factor in the consideration for approval of all developments.
10. Development proposals that will affect drainage on adjacent properties, roads, or watercourses shall include a drainage plan that addresses the impacts and mitigation measures affecting water quality and flooding.

**Land Use and Growth:**
29. In reviewing the environmental impacts of a proposal, the County will require development projects to demonstrate sensitivity to the natural and cultural environment including preservation of views, trees, and native vegetation; consideration of wildlife; preservation of dark skies; and conservation of water resources.
40. The County shall support industrial development projects in areas that are currently zoned industrial and where adequate levels of infrastructure exists or could be reasonably developed.

**Economic Development:**
21. The County encourages the establishment of industries that contribute to the region’s economic health and support community character.

### Compliance with the Doney Park/Timberline/Fernwood Area Plan

2. For the existing industrial zones, only low water using industrial facilities not exceeding 25,000 gallons of water per month shall be given consideration.
3. Performance standards for industrial zones shall be strictly adhered to.
4. Environmental impacts shall be carefully considered in reviewing new industrial projects.
5. For industrial uses requiring a conditional use permit, at a minimum the following concerns and impacts shall be considered: roads, traffic, dust, visual impact, infrastructure, fire protection, odor, lighting, and hazardous materials.

### Compliance with the Flagstaff Regional Plan

**Area Type: Employment**

Policy LU.16.1. Encourage the continued intensification, expansion, and protection of existing industrial, warehousing, and distribution uses from encroachment where appropriate.
**Compliance with the Zoning Ordinance**

Trucking Yards are allowed in the M-2-6,000 Zone through approval of a Conditional Use Permit (Section 2.9.B.51).

**Setbacks:** The proposed 16.9’ front setback meets the minimum requirement of 10’.

**Parking:** Proposed Parking meets the requirements of Section 4.1, Parking.

**Fencing:** Beige-colored slats are proposed to be installed in the existing chain link fence as screening, which is sufficient in this heavy industrial area.

**Lighting:** The preliminary lighting plan proposes 792,935 lumens in a variety of fixtures that are all amber LED and fully shielded, and meets the requirements of the Section 4.3, Lighting. A lighting permit will be required prior to installation of new lighting.

**Signs:** Additional signage is not proposed.

**Landscaping:** The applicant has submitted a landscape plan with for approval by the Commission. There are 26 existing blue spruce trees along the frontage of the property on Leupp Road, and staff has confirmed these are mature, healthy trees that have grown well without irrigation. The existing spruce are proposed to be supplemented by additional native and drought tolerant trees and shrubs as shown on the landscape plan. A waiver is requested to the standards requiring landscaping internal to the site because the site is not open to the public. The applicant has rather provided trees for screening along the frontage and landscaping at the entrance to the site.

**Design Review Overlay**

The proposed development is an industrial use located within the Doney Park/Timberline/Fernwood Plan Area and subject to the Design Review Guidelines found on pages 50-54 of the Area Plan. The project includes one new building that is proposed to be tan in color with matching architectural shingles to blend with the natural environment similar in color to the existing warehouse on the property. The proposed material is heavily textured consistent with the Design Guidelines. The landscape plan proposes native trees and shrubs consistent with the Design Guidelines as documented in the submitted landscape plan. New signage is not proposed and will be subject to Design Guidelines as determined by staff if requested at a later date as provide for in Section 2.15.C.3.B, Design Review Overlay. The lighting plan is consistent with Lighting Zone II as required by the Design Guidelines including pole lighting limited to 25 feet.

**Findings of Staff**

**Findings of Fact required to approve a Conditional Use Permit**

1. That the proposed location of the conditional use is in accord with the objectives of this Ordinance and the purpose of the zone in which the site is located.
Staff's Response: A trucking yard is an appropriate use within the industrial area that includes industrial storage, auto recycling and manufacturing uses.

2. That the proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which it would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.
   Staff's Response: Proposed use is appropriate for this area and will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.

3. That the proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of this Ordinance, except for approved variances.
   Staff's Response: The proposed conditional use permit meets the requirement of the Zoning Ordinance except where waivers are required for paving and landscaping.

4. That the proposed conditional use is consistent with and conforms to the goals, objectives and policies of the General Plan or Specific Plan for the area.
   Staff's Response: The proposed development complies with the Comprehensive Plan based on the goals and policies cited in the staff report.

Recommendation of Staff

The proposed truck relay station is an appropriate use in this heavy industrial area and provides important economic development for the county. The application meets the goals and policies of the Comprehensive Plan and Doney Park/Timberline/Fernwood Area Plan both cited in the staff report. The applicant has proposed landscaping, screening, lighting and the design of the building appropriate for the area plan Design Guidelines. Staff recommends approval of CUP-19-036 and DRO-19-002 with the recommended conditions.

Recommended Conditions of Approval for the Conditional Use Permit and Design Review Overlay.

1. The development shall substantially comply with the approved site plan and the design of the building and site as approved through the Design Review Overlay.

2. A waste receptacle shall be installed and screened and/or enclosed subject to the approval of the Community Development Director per Zoning Ordinance Section 2.7.D.3.c.
3. A paving waiver is granted allowing use of aggregate in lieu of paving for the employee and semi-tractor parking as proposed. The semi-trailer area shall be paved as proposed. All required disabled parking spaces must be paved as approved by the Building Division.

4. A landscaping waiver is granted approving the proposed landscape plan in lieu of the landscaping requirements in Section 4.4, Landscaping. The applicant shall submit a weed mitigation plan and complete all weed mitigation prior to approval of the certificate of occupancy for the trucking yard.

5. Privacy slats shall be installed in the existing fencing for screening. Slats shall be beige in color as proposed by the applicant.

6. A lighting permit shall be approved prior to the installation of any outdoor lighting. All lighting shall substantially comply with the approved lighting plan and shall be fully-shielded, amber LED lighting as proposed by the applicant.

7. A sign permit application shall be submitted and approved prior to the installation of any new signage. All signage must meet the Design Guidelines of the Doney Park/Timberline/Fernwood Area Plan.

8. A floodplain study will be required to determine the extent of the Special Flood Hazard Area on the site and the 100-year Base Flood Elevation (BFE). A floodplain development permit will be required prior to the development of the site.

9. A Traffic Impact Statement meeting the requirements of the County Transportation Planner and sealed by a licensed Professional Engineer shall be submitted. The applicant shall make any improvements identified in the TIS as determined by the Community Development Engineering Division, the County Public Works Department, or the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT).

Respectfully submitted,

Jess McNeely, AICP, Assistant Director
Prepared by Bob Short, Principal Planner

Attachments:

Applicant Narrative
Introduction

Background Information

| Site Address:       | 7201 E Leupp Road, Flagstaff, AZ 86004 |
| Location:           | Doney Park                                |
| APN#:               | 303-41-004B                               |
| Zoning:             | M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial, 6,000 square foot parcel size minimum) |
| Parcel Area:        | 16.69 acres                               |
| Net Parcel Area:    | 14.79 acres                               |
| Applicant:          | FedEx Freight                             |
| Applicant Address:  | 2200 Forward Dr. Harrison, AR 72601       |
| Owner:              | Paul Wolfe                                |
| Owner Address:      | 7201 Leupp Road, Flagstaff, AZ 86004      |

Historic/Existing Site Use

The subject property was used as an auto-recycling yard from the 1973 to 2014. The auto-recycling business was closed c.2015 and the stored vehicles were removed. Currently the site is occupied by an 11,850-sq. ft. metal building, a 1,050-sq. ft. log house, 1,610-sq. ft. metal barn, a wooden shed, and a truck scale.

Surrounding Land Uses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surrounding Land Uses/Zoning</th>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>Auto-recycling</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>Truss manufacturing</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>US Forest Service</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>Auto-recycling, vacant land, bulk propane storage</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proposed use

The subject parcel is 16.7 acres, a portion of which is occupied by the easement for Leupp Rd, leaving 14.8 acres of developable area. The existing buildings occupy the southeastern approximately 3 acres, leaving roughly 11.8 acres vacant for the proposed development. The owner has leased this portion of the site to be used as a truck freight relay yard. The proposed improvements include security fencing, site lighting, a modular building, an employee parking lot, truck tractor parking, and trailer parking.
The semi-truck yard will function as a location for drivers to park, switch trailers, park trailers, and depart. Most of the traffic will occur early to mid-morning and mid to late afternoon. The site is anticipated to generate approximately 628 trips per day, a mix of truck and passenger vehicles.

The modular building will provide a break room and restroom facilities for drivers, up to 91 employees. No full-time employees will stay onsite. The site will be operated intermittently from 7 am to 6 pm. The site will be fenced with electronic security access-controlled entrances. Site lighting will comply with dark sky requirements.

**Site Design**

The proposed site improvements will be generally graded to fit the existing landforms on site with grades sloping generally from west to east at 2%. No retaining walls are proposed.

**Floodplain**

The subject parcel is partially encumbered with the Federal Emergency Management Agency’s (FEMA) Flood Zone ‘A’. Areas within Flood Zone A are not completely modeled, so the limits of the floodway and storm water depth for the 1% chance event are unknown. The area of the subject parcel encumbered by floodwater, as indicated by the Zone ‘A’ Map, is a triangular area at the north end of the site and a triangular area at the southeast corner of the site.

The proposed improvements include semi-trailer parking within the Zone ‘A’ area as shown on the site plan.

**Utilities**

Sewer service will be vault and haul. FedEx will contract with a sewage hauler to remove sewage from a septic tank. The site is served by Doney Park Water and there is an existing water meter onsite. The proposed improvements will include a water service from the customer side of the water meter to the new building.

**Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan**

The Coconino County Comprehensive plan sets many goals for the county given its diversity. The proposed site use fits within the overall goals of the plan implemented through the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed project is a site redevelopment which falls under the pillar of environmental sustainability. Under the economic pillar, the proposed site development will maintain and provide local jobs within the community since truck drivers reside near the proposed site.

**Section 2.9.D.1 Parking**

91 onsite parking stalls for passenger vehicles are proposed in accordance with Section 4.1.C:

Minimum Required: 2 parking spaces for each 3 employees

Provided: 1 parking space for each employee

The passenger vehicle parking area will be gravel. The Additional parking shown is for semi-truck tractors and trailers, 72 stalls and 87 stalls respectively. Parking for semi-trailers will be concrete, parking for semi-truck tractors will be gravel. Parking includes 4 A.D.A. parking stalls adjacent to the office building.
Section 2.9.D.2 Landscaping

The proposed landscaping will be focused along Leupp Rd. to providing screening of the overall site from the public’s view in conjunction with the privacy slates in the chain link fencing. The plant materials proposed are either native or locally adaptable plant materials that are low water use, easy maintenance and will blend with the natural plant materials near the site. The existing pine trees along Leupp Rd. will be incorporated into the design and enhanced by the additional trees and shrubs in the plant palette. No internal site landscaping is proposed as the site is not open to the public. All new landscaping and existing trees along Leupp Rd. will be irrigated by a permanent underground irrigation system that meets or exceeds current industry standards based on the location and weather on site. The existing trees adjacent to Leupp Rd. will be preserved with the development.

Section 2.9.D.3 Screening

Screening the site will be accomplished by a combination of enhanced landscaping west of the perimeter fencing and with the addition of privacy slates to the existing or new chain link fencing along Leupp Rd. The color of the slating will be a beige tone that will be compatible with the buildings on site and the grassland nature of the surrounding areas.

Section 2.9.D.4 Lighting

New full cut-off type narrow spectrum amber light source area lighting fixtures to be used for all lighting fixtures on site. See attached site photometric lighting plans and fixture specification sheets showing proposed lighting fixture types and layout. Lighting fixtures denoted as “SLP” are to be pole mounted at +25’-0” above finished grade. Lighting fixtures denoted as “SLW” are to be wall mounted at +9’-0” above finished floor elevation. Refer to site lumen calculations shown on sheet E1 for compliance with total allowable site lumens compliance per astronomical lighting zone-2 as designated by the local exterior lighting ordinance.

Section 2.9.D.5 Signs

No additional signage is proposed as part of this development.

Section 2.9.D Accessory Structures

The proposed building is not in front of the existing buildings on the site and meets the setback requirements.

Architectural Style

The modular office building will be a low pitched, gabled, single story structure, with a footprint of approximately 24’x60’. The exterior walls will be clad in prefinished, wood textured lap siding. The building will have an eave height of approximately 10’ and the finished floor elevation will be approximately 30” above finish grade. There will be wooden stairs and an ADA ramp to provide access. The overall design intent of the building is to achieve a residential feel and scale.

Materials and Colors

The office building will be covered in a prefinished, lap siding of natural wood textured, gray toned, weather resistant material. The building will have laminated asphalt shingle. The selected shingle color is a multicolored gray/earth tone laminated shingle which provides texture, shadowing and variations of color which will be in keeping with a rustic, residential feel. The wooden stairs and ramps will be finished in gray tones to complement the finishes of the office building.
Variances Requests

Paving
The proposed improvements include concrete paving part of 11.8 acres, the entry drive and the trailer parking area, and leaving the remainder, including drive aisles between concrete trailer parking pads, gravel. Historically the auto-recycling yard was entirely packed gravel. This would maintain much of that condition. This configuration reduces the amount of additional impervious area. Dust is not anticipated to be a problem since this site has historically been packed gravel with vehicle traffic.

Detention
The Coconino County Drainage Design Criteria manual requires detention for developments that increase the impervious surface area. A waiver is requested for detention for the following reasons:

a. Since the site was previously developed and consists primarily of compacted gravel where recycled autos were stored, hydrologically the runoff difference between the current condition and the proposed condition is relatively limited. The estimated existing conditions (100-yr) runoff is 43-cfs and the proposed conditions runoff is 46.6-cfs, a runoff increase of 3.6-cfs.

b. This site is bounded to the northwest by San Francisco Wash and to the east by Walnut Canyon Wash with estimated discharges of 7,280-cfs and 6,460-cfs respectively for a combined runoff of 13,740-cfs. The watersheds constitute 355 square miles upstream of the site. The total runoff generated from the site constitutes 0.3% of the runoff from both watersheds which is statistically insignificant.

c. There is little if any development downstream of the site that would be impacted by the runoff increase from the development.

Landscape Islands
The proposed development is requesting a waiver for interior parking lot landscaping as required by Section 4.4.C.14 of the Zoning Ordinance and the Doney Park Timberline Fernwood Area Plan. The site is not open to the public and the landscape & fence screening along Leupp road will block any public benefit from the on-site parking landscaping. The larger trucker moving within the secured portions of the site will also create conflicts with establishing and properly maintaining trees and shrubs.

Findings of Fact
1. That the proposed location of the CUP is in accord with the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance and the purpose of the zone in which the site is located.
   Trucking Yards and Truck Stops is a permitted use subject to a CUP per Section 2.9.B. The proposed use fits the definition of a Truck Yard in the Zoning Ordinance.

2. That the proposed location of the CUP and the conditions under which it would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.
   The subject parcel has historically been used for industrial purposes and surrounding areas are industrial in nature, including auto-recycling and truss manufacturing.

3. That the proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, except for approved variances.
   Proposed variances are listed in the variance section.

4. That the proposed conditional use is consistent with and conforms to the goals, objectives and policies of the General Plan or Specific Plan for the area.
Introduction

Background Information

Site Address: 7201 E Leupp Road, Flagstaff, AZ 86004
Location: Doney Park
APN#: 303-41-004B
Zoning: M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial, 6,000 square foot parcel size minimum)
Parcel Area: 16.69 acres
Net Parcel Area: 14.79 acres
Applicant: FedEx Freight
Applicant Address: 2200 Forward Dr. Harrison, AR 72601
Owner: Paul Wolfe
Owner Address: 7201 Leupp Road, Flagstaff, AZ 86004

Historic/Existing Site use

The subject property was used as an auto-recycling yard from the 1973 to 2014. The auto-recycling business was closed c.2015 and the stored vehicles were removed. Currently the site is occupied by an 11,850-sq. ft. metal building, a 1,050-sq. ft. log house, 1,610-sq.ft. metal barn, a wooden shed, and a truck scale.

Surrounding Land Uses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surrounding Land Uses/Zoning</th>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>Auto-recycling</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>Truss manufacturing</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>US Forest Service</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>Auto-recycling, vacant land, bulk propane storage</td>
<td>M-2-6,000 (Heavy Industrial)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proposed use

The subject parcel is 16.7 acres, a portion of which is occupied by the easement for Leupp Rd, leaving 14.8 acres of developable area. The existing buildings occupy the southeastern approximately 3 acres, leaving roughly 11.8 acres vacant for the proposed development. The owner has leased this portion of the site to be used as a truck freight relay yard. The proposed improvements include security fencing, site lighting, a modular building, an employee parking lot, truck tractor parking, and trailer parking.
The semi-truck yard will function as a location for drivers to park, switch trailers, park trailers, and depart. Most of the traffic will occur early to mid-morning and mid to late afternoon. The site is anticipated to generate approximately 628 trips per day, a mix of truck and passenger vehicles.

The modular building will provide a break room and restroom facilities for drivers, up to 91 employees. No full-time employees will stay onsite. The site will be operated intermittently from 7 am to 6 pm. The site will be fenced with electronic security access-controlled entrances. Site lighting will comply with dark sky requirements.

**Site Design**

The proposed site improvements will be generally graded to fit the existing landforms on site with grades sloping generally from west to east at 2%. No retaining walls are proposed.

**Floodplain**

The subject parcel is partially encumbered with the Federal Emergency Management Agency’s (FEMA) Flood Zone ‘A’. Areas within Flood Zone A are not completely modeled, so the limits of the floodway and storm water depth for the 1% chance event are unknown. The area of the subject parcel encumbered by floodwater, as indicated by the Zone ‘A’ Map, is a triangular area at the north end of the site and a triangular area at the southeast corner of the site.

The proposed improvements include semi-trailer parking within the Zone ‘A’ area as shown on the site plan.

**Utilities**

Sewer service will be vault and haul. FedEx will contract with a sewage hauler to remove sewage from a septic tank. The site is served by Doney Park Water and there is an existing water meter onsite. The proposed improvements will include a water service from the customer side of the water meter to the new building.

**Compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan**

The Coconino County Comprehensive plan sets many goals for the county given its diversity. The proposed site use fits within the overall goals of the plan implemented through the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed project is a site redevelopment which falls under the pillar of environmental sustainability. Under the economic pillar, the proposed site development will maintain and provide local jobs within the community since truck drivers reside near the proposed site.

**Section 2.9.D.1 Parking**

91 onsite parking stalls for passenger vehicles are proposed in accordance with Section 4.1.C:

- **Minimum Required:** 2 parking spaces for each 3 employees
- **Provided:** 1 parking space for each employee

The passenger vehicle parking area will be gravel. The Additional parking shown is for semi-truck tractors and trailers, 72 stalls and 87 stalls respectively. Parking for semi-trailers will be concrete, parking for semi-truck tractors will be gravel. Parking includes 4 A.D.A. parking stalls adjacent to the office building.
Section 2.9.D.2 Landscaping

The proposed landscaping will be focused along Leupp Rd. to providing screening of the overall site from the public’s view in conjunction with the privacy slates in the chain link fencing. The plant materials proposed are either native or locally adaptable plant materials that are low water use, easy maintenance and will blend with the natural plant materials near the site. The existing pine trees along Leupp Rd. will be incorporated into the design and enhanced by the additional trees and shrubs in the plant palette. No internal site landscaping is proposed as the site is not open to the public. All new landscaping and existing trees along Leupp Rd. will be irrigated by a permanent underground irrigation system that meets or exceeds current industry standards based on the location and weather on site. The existing trees adjacent to Leupp Rd. will be preserved with the development.

Section 2.9.D.3 Screening

Screening the site will be accomplished by a combination of enhanced landscaping west of the perimeter fencing and with the addition of privacy slates to the existing or new chain link fencing along Leupp Rd. The color of the slating will be a beige tone that will be compatible with the buildings on site and the grassland nature of the surrounding areas.

Section 2.9.D.4 Lighting

New full cut-off type narrow spectrum amber light source area lighting fixtures to be used for all lighting fixtures on site. See attached site photometric lighting plans and fixture specification sheets showing proposed lighting fixture types and layout. Lighting fixtures denoted as “SLP” are to be pole mounted at +25′-0”above finished grade. Lighting fixtures denoted as “SLW” are to be wall mounted at +9′-0”above finished floor elevation. Refer to site lumens calculations shown on sheet E1 for compliance with total allowable site lumens compliance per astronomical lighting zone-2 as designated by the local exterior lighting ordinance.

Section 2.9.D.5 Signs

No additional signage is proposed as part of this development.

Section 2.9.D Accessory Structures

The proposed building is not in front of the existing buildings on the site and meets the setback requirements.

Architectural Style

The modular office building will be a low pitched, gabled, single story structure, with a footprint of approximately 24′x60′. The exterior walls will be clad in prefinished, wood textured lap siding. The building will have an eave height of approximately 10′ and the finished floor elevation will be approximately 30” above finish grade. There will be wooden stairs and an ADA ramp to provide access. The overall design intent of the building is to achieve a residential feel and scale.

Materials and Colors

The office building will be covered in a prefinished, lap siding of natural wood textured, gray toned, weather resistant material. The building will have laminated asphalt shingle. The selected shingle color is a multicolored gray/earth tone laminated shingle which provides texture, shadowing and variations of color which will be in keeping with a rustic, residential feel. The wooden stairs and ramps will be finished in gray tones to complement the finishes of the office building.
Variance Requests

Paving
The proposed improvements include concrete paving part of 11.8 acres, the entry drive and the trailer parking area, and leaving the remainder, including drive aisles between concrete trailer parking pads, gravel. Historically the auto-recycling yard was entirely packed gravel. This would maintain much of that condition. This configuration reduces the amount of additional impervious area. Dust is not anticipated to be a problem since this site has historically been packed gravel with vehicle traffic.

Detention
The Coconino County Drainage Design Criteria manual requires detention for developments that increase the impervious surface area. A waiver is requested for detention for the following reasons:

a. Since the site was previously developed and consists primarily of compacted gravel where recycled autos were stored, hydrologically the runoff difference between the current condition and the proposed condition is relatively limited. The estimated existing conditions (100-yr) runoff is 43-cfs and the proposed conditions runoff is 46.6-cfs, a runoff increase of 3.6-cfs.

b. This site is bounded to the northwest by San Francisco Wash and to the east by Walnut Canyon Wash with estimated discharges of 7,280-cfs and 6,460-cfs respectively for a combined runoff of 13,740-cfs. The watersheds constitute 355 square miles upstream of the site. The total runoff generated from the site constitutes 0.3% of the runoff from both watersheds which is statistically insignificant.

c. There is little if any development downstream of the site that would be impacted by the runoff increase from the development.

Landscape Islands
The proposed development is requesting a waiver for interior parking lot landscaping as required by Section 4.4.C.14 of the Zoning Ordinance and the Doney Park Timberline Fernwood Area Plan. The site is not open to the public and the landscape & fence screening along Leupp road will block any public benefit from the on-site parking landscaping. The larger trucker moving within the secured portions of the site will also create conflicts with establishing and properly maintaining trees and shrubs.

Findings of Fact
1. That the proposed location of the CUP is in accord with the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance and the purpose of the zone in which the site is located.
   Trucking Yards and Truck Stops is a permitted use subject to a CUP per Section 2.9.B. The proposed use fits the definition of a Truck Yard in the Zoning Ordinance.

2. That the proposed location of the CUP and the conditions under which it would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.
   The subject parcel has historically been used for industrial purposes and surrounding areas are industrial in nature, including auto-recycling and truss manufacturing.

3. That the proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, except for approved variances.
   Proposed variances are listed in the variance section.

4. That the proposed conditional use is consistent with and conforms to the goals, objectives and policies of the General Plan or Specific Plan for the area.
SCRATCH RESISTANT FINISH
We surface prep the board to ensure proper adhesion for long term performance. Our finish is more scratch resistant than other competitive products.

INNOVATIVE SHEEN
Diamond Kote® is designed to be low maintenance by reducing the build up of dirt and grime while locking out moisture.

CONSISTENT QUALITY
Our rotating arm spray system provides consistent paint coverage by breaking down the finish into smaller particles allowing it to bond better for flawless coverage.

PEACE OF MIND
We back the factory-applied Diamond Kote® finish with a 30-Year No Fade Limited Warranty which includes 15 years of labor coverage with the first seven years at 100% value.
Jay Christelman, Director

Date: September 17, 2019

To: Planning and Zoning Commission

From: Department of Community Development

Subject: Public Hearing and consideration of Case Number CUP-19-035, a request for a conditional use permit for a church and associated sign and structure height waivers.

Executive Summary

Recommendation: Staff recommends approval with the eleven (11) recommended conditions.

Location: The subject property is located on the south side of W Route 66, just east of the Coca Cola plant on Flagstaff Ranch Road and just west of the City of Flagstaff municipal boundaries where the Timber Sky development is under construction. It is identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 116-04-016.
Parcel Size: 10 acres

Zoning: General (10-acre minimum single family and agricultural zone)

Supervisor District: 1 (Art Babbott)

Applicant: Brian Ketter of Grace Community Church- Flagstaff, AZ

Owner: N&J Properties VII LLC- Tucson, AZ

### Background Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th>Zoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>On Site</strong></td>
<td><strong>Vacant</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>North</strong></td>
<td><strong>Residential</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>South</strong></td>
<td><strong>Multifamily (Timber Sky)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>East</strong></td>
<td><strong>Multifamily (Timber Sky)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>West</strong></td>
<td><strong>Manufacturing</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Natural Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Topography</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Natural Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Aerial Photo with topography (2-foot contours)
Proposed Development

The applicant’s submitted narrative proposes a 35,000 to 40,000 square foot church facing Route 66 with a driveway on W Route 66 and parking behind the church. Access to the property would be from W Route 66 at the northeastern corner of the property. The church would include worship, educational, and office facilities and periodic special events mostly on Saturdays. A freestanding sign of approximately 186 square feet is requested near the northeast property corner adjacent to W Route 66. Proposed parking exceeds Zoning Ordinance requirements.

The applicant proposes to use narrow spectrum amber LEDs for all outdoor lighting. The applicant proposes full paving of all driveway and parking services.

Citizen Participation

The applicant sent a letter out to 32 neighboring properties within the notification radius of 1,000 feet from the property lines of the subject property. The Citizen Participation Plan meeting was held on August 15, 2019 with four attendees (two couples) from neighboring properties on W Route 66. The attendees wrote letters in favor of this request.

Staff Analysis

Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 Map- Area in red is subject property and within ‘Future Suburban’ and ‘Future Employment’ areas designated in the Plan’s Future Land Use Map
Compliance with the Regional Plan
Proposed Use: Church with associated sign waivers

- Policy E&C.5.2. Encourage and incentivize voluntary reduction of "exempt" lighting that degrades night sky visibility, and work to prevent light trespass whenever possible in both public and private areas.
- Policy CC.1.4. Identify, protect, and enhance gateways, gateway corridors, and gateway communities.
- Policy LU.13.6. Include a mix of uses and access to surrounding neighborhoods in new suburban commercial development.
- Policy LU.13.7. Include employment opportunities in all suburban activity centers
- Policy LU.18.2. Strive for activity centers and corridors that are characterized by contextual and distinctive identities, derived from history, environmental features, a mix of uses, well-designed public spaces, parks, plazas, and high-quality design.

Compliance with the Comprehensive Plan
Proposed Use: Church with associated sign waivers

- Work with communities to designate and describe the future of activity centers in their area. - Land Use and Growth Policy 38
- The County shall work closely with applicants for public use / service land uses to minimize the potential impacts on residential areas, rural character, and the environment. - Land Use and Growth Policy 45
- Public and semipublic uses shall be approved at locations convenient to the population being served, provided that such locations are compatible with and complimentary to surrounding neighborhoods. - Community Character Policy 6
- The concentration of commercial, public, and semipublic uses in an activity center is desirable and encouraged. - Community Character Policy 9
- The County supports the development of neighborhood commercial uses, community facilities (including shared), and activities that promote and generate public interaction. - Community Character Policy 11
- The County supports community facilities and activities that promote a greater sense of place by enhancing community identity and local pride. - Community Character Policy 12
- The County supports the use of simulation technology and viewshed analysis when siting development projects affecting scenic corridors and unique features. - Community Character Policy 23
- To reduce impacts on views, structures and infrastructure shall be planned and built in a manner that minimizes impacts on horizon and ridgelines. - Community Character Policy 26
- The County recognizes the economic and social benefits of dark skies by implementing innovative lighting practices and technologies on County projects and facilities and in the regulation of others through the application of its ordinances and promotion of best practices - Community Character Policy 33
- Full shielding of all outdoor lighting, installation of low-pressure sodium or "narrow-spectrum" amber LED fixtures, and the use of other best available technologies shall be encouraged and enforced through the Lighting Ordinance. - Community Character Policy 36
• Areas near existing professional observatories or other dark-sky preservation areas shall be developed with special consideration for the impacts that development may have on dark skies. - Community Character Policy 38

Height Waiver Request

The height maximum for the G Zone is 40’ from natural grade. The applicant proposes a maximum height of the structure not to exceed 57’ (see attached elevations and applicant’s submitted elevations and structure height study pages 23 through 26). This height is requested for approximately 20% of the roof’s area for a ‘triforium’, a prism shaped strip of roof from front to rear. The applicant proposes a height of 40’ for the remaining roof area. The applicant justifies the requested height of the structure in their attached height study that shows the proposed structure in context with the height of neighboring properties’ structure heights. Staff supports this request based on the proposed structure’s context with the other properties in the vicinity and because the architectural articulation of the roof will give the structure a less monolithic look more in line with an aesthetic for a gateway into the City of Flagstaff.

Sign Waiver Request

The Zoning Ordinance limits freestanding sign height to 6’ from natural grade and area to 15 square feet for public and semi-public uses in the G Zone. One wall mounted sign is also typically permitted at 6 square feet. The applicant proposes an 8’ tall, 186 square foot freestanding sign and one 165 square foot wall mounted sign on the northwest elevation facing W Route 66. The applicant justifies their waiver request in their sign study in context with the neighboring properties along W Route 66 (pages 4 through 22 of the applicant’s submittal. Pages 9 and 22 show the proposed signage in relation to the neighboring properties to the east and west). The applicant proposes the freestanding sign with letters popped out in shiny aluminum and faux rust aluminum for the background. The wall mounted sign would be popped out from the northward facing wall. Both signs would have recessed ‘halo’ lighting within the letters shining onto the background. Staff finds that the waiver request is consistent with the context of signage on surrounding properties and that the signage requested is consistent with an aesthetic for a gateway into the City of Flagstaff.

Lighting

The subject property is within Lighting Zone 1, the most restrictive of the lighting zones, and is relatively close to Lowell Observatory to the northeast. The applicant’s request for additional height (see Height Waiver Request section above) would increase the amount of window area facing to the north which could cause interior light to spill outside of those windows in a way not anticipated by existing Dark Skies requirements. The applicant met with a lighting consultant to come up with options that would mitigate any additional indoor lighting spilling outside the building. The applicant, the lighting consultant, and staff agreed that screens on the exterior windows and/or ‘adaptive controls’ of the indoor lighting (using motion sensors to activate lights only when someone is in the area and dimming them progressively until
Lighting Zone I curfew at 9pm) would adequately mitigate indoor lighting affects on the dark skies. This is addressed in staff’s proposed condition 5. Additional mitigation factors for nearby Lowell Observatory include retention of trees at about 60 to 70 feet in height between the structure and W Route 66 and the orientation of the windows directly north and away from Lowell Observatory, which is northeast of the subject property.

The applicant proposes that all lighting associated with the signage noted above be ‘halo’ lighting, or internally lit with lights inside the opaque letters and shining onto the background (see example from applicant’s supplemental information packet below). This lighting is consistent with Dark Skies requirements of the Zoning Ordinance and with the gateway aesthetic into the City of Flagstaff.

![Inspire Salon](image1.png)

*Example of ‘halo’ lighting of signage from applicant’s*

![Grace Community Church](image2.png)

*Applicant’s example of ‘halo’ lighting proposed for Grace Community Church freestanding sign*

## Findings of Staff

### Findings of Fact required to approve a Conditional Use Permit:

1. That the proposed location of the conditional use is in accord with the objectives of this Ordinance and the purpose of the zone in which the site is located.

   **Staff’s Response:** The proposed location is in accordance with the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance that allow for Churches in the General Zone subject to a Conditional Use Permit. Waivers for height and signage are justified by the context of the property in relation to neighboring properties’ signage and height as well as mitigation factors for light trespass that meet the intents of Section 4.3: Lighting.
2. That the proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which it would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.

Staff’s Response: The proposed location of the use is within a gateway to the City of Flagstaff and has an aesthetic that meets expectations for a gateway with attractive architectural designs. The property is 10 acres in size and is a good transition and buffer between industrial property to the west and multifamily projects within the City of Flagstaff to the east that are currently under construction. The project as proposed will not be detrimental to public health, safety, or welfare, nor will it be materially injurious to properties and improvements in the vicinity.

3. That the proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of this Ordinance, except for approved variances.

Staff’s Response: The applicant’s proposed structure meets the applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance except for waivers in structure height and signage allowances as discussed above. Staff supports both waivers as justified by the applicant.

4. That the proposed conditional use is consistent with and conforms to the goals, objectives and policies of the General Plan or Specific Plan for the area.

Staff’s Response: The proposed use is consistent with the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 and the Comprehensive Plan that seek to locate community serving uses in appropriate places while maintaining community character and reducing impacts to residential properties and dark skies.

Recommendation of Staff

Staff recommends approval of CUP-19-035 with the eleven (11) conditions in the staff report.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

1. Development of the subject property shall substantially conform to the approved site plan, elevations, and narrative. Any substantial changes or expansions shall require further review by the Planning and Zoning Commission.

2. A waiver to structure height is hereby granted for the ‘triforium’ roof as shown in the applicant’s submitted plans and no higher than 57’ from natural grade. All other portions of the structure shall be no higher than 40’ from natural grade.

3. A waiver to sign size is hereby approved for a 186 square foot freestanding sign and a 165 square foot wall mounted sign as shown in the applicants submitted plans. Lighting of the signs shall be in the ‘halo’ style as shown in the plans.
4. A Building Permit shall be approved prior to construction. The applicant must submit the Building Permit and diligently pursue it toward completion within one year of approval of this request or request an extension from the Planning and Zoning Commission.

5. A Traffic Impact Analysis or Traffic Statement shall be approved prior to or concurrently with approval of the required Building Permit subject to the approval of the Engineering Supervisor.

6. An Encroachment permit shall be approved prior to or concurrent with approval of the required Building Permit subject to the approval of the Engineering Supervisor.

7. The applicant shall minimize light trespass and impact from indoor lighting spilling into the outdoors to the extent possible through one or both methods described hereafter: 1) solar screens shall be placed on all exterior windows and closed by 9pm, the outdoor lighting curfew for Lighting Zone I; 2) The applicant shall install and maintain adaptive controls with motion sensors for indoor lighting that dim or turn off indoor lighting when there is no motion in the area and that turn off indoor lights when there is no motion in the area by 9pm, with the exception that for any special events where the structure is occupied after 9pm that the indoor lighting may remain on until 30 minutes after the event has ended.

8. All outdoor lighting shall be fully shielded, narrow band amber LEDs that meet the requirements of Section 4.3 of the Zoning Ordinance.

9. Landscaping shall be installed in accordance with Section 4.4 of the Zoning Ordinance. Existing trees, especially between the proposed structure and W Route 66, shall be retained to the maximum extent possible.

10. The applicant shall construct a 6’ masonry wall between any adjacent residentially zoned property. Alternatives to masonry include double-sided solid wood fencing, native stone or rock veneered walls, an adequate vegetative buffer, or combination thereof may be approved by the Director of Community Development for screening and sound attenuation.

11. This use permit shall be valid for a period of five years to expire September 25, 2024 before which time a new application shall be submitted for renewal if continuation of the use beyond the expiration date is desired. If the conditional use permit meets the conditions and is renewed administratively, a perpetual term shall be applied without the need for additional renewals.
Respectfully submitted,

[Signature]

Jess McNeely, AICP, Assistant Director
Prepared by Zach Schwartz, Senior Planner

Attachment:

Exhibit 1: Applicant’s submitted addendum dated September 11, 2019 titled Supplemental Information response to Study Session Comments, Grace Community Church Conditional Use Permit
PROJECT NARRATIVE
FOR
GRACE COMMUNITY CHURCH
CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

SWI #18258

Parcel Number: 116-04-016
Section 24, T21N, R6E, G&SRM
Coconino County, Arizona

Prepared for
Grace Community Church
5200 E. Cortland Blvd., Ste. A17
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

Prepared by
Shephard - Wesnitzer, Inc.
110 W. Dale Avenue
Flagstaff, AZ 86001
(928) 773-0354

August 16, 2019
PROJECT LOCATION
The project is located on Parcel Number 116-04-016 in Coconino County, Arizona on W. Route 66 near S. Flagstaff Ranch Road. The subject parcel is located in a portion of Section 24, Township 21 North, Range 06 East, of Coconino County, Arizona.

PROJECT SUMMARY
Grace Community Church has been ministering in the Flagstaff area for over twenty-five (25) years. The main Sunday services have been and currently are held at Sinagua Middle School, 3950 E. Butler. The church Offices/Ministry Center is located at 5200 E. Cortland Blvd., Suite A17 in Flagstaff. This 10-acre, 85,000 to 40,000 square foot project will be the new permanent home for the church and will provide worship, educational, and office facilities. The office will be open weekdays during normal office hours. Smaller classes and groups will meet throughout the week during the evening. Church services and other events will take place throughout the day on Sundays. Periodically events will take place on Saturdays. As indicated above the new facility will be constructed along W. Route 66 east of S. Flagstaff Ranch Road. See the Vicinity Map below.

ZONING
The subject parcel is located in an unincorporated area of Coconino County. The current zoning of the property is General (G). A Conditional Use Permit (CUP) is required for the development of a church within this zoning designation.

DEVELOPMENT PLAN
The site will be developed as a single phase where the building will be constructed with the ability to add additional classrooms and office space. The adjacent property is zoned industrial to the east, general to the north, and residential to the west. The property to the south is currently zoned commercial, but during discussion with the owner it is intended to be developed as residential. The church is requesting that the required screening fence along the adjacent residential development be installed at the time these properties begin construction. This would
allow the church to work with the adjacent property owner to select a fence style that is appealing to both properties.

NEIGHBORHOOD MEETING
As part of a Citizen Participation Plan, a neighborhood meeting was held on August 15th, 2019 at 6:00 pm at the Flagstaff Double Tree Hotel and Conference Center. The results of this meeting, including input received, are attached to the CUP application.

DRAINAGE AND UTILITIES
The site currently drains primarily from the west to the east. The development of the property will not alter the existing drainage patterns. Detention area will be provided along the east property line and will be utilized to maintain the runoff at predevelopment levels.

Water will be provided to the property by Flagstaff Ranch Water Company. The nearest location of existing facilities is located within S. Flagstaff Ranch Road. A new main will be extended east through the neighboring property to provide service. The service will be sized to provide on-site fire protection. An onsite package plant will be utilized to treat and dispose the wastewater generated from the site. The package plant will treat the wastewater by means of advanced treatment with textile filter along with UV for disinfection. The wastewater will be disposed of by means of a subsurface drip system throughout the site.

ACCESS/TRAFFIC
The site will be accessed from W. Route 66. The proposed access will consist of one ingress lane and two egress lanes. The west bound egress lane will have space for 5 cars to stack before it would impact the east bound egress lane. The anticipated traffic generated from the site is shown below in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>ITE Land Use</th>
<th>Units</th>
<th>Trip Generation Rate</th>
<th>Trips</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weekday am</td>
<td>710 (Office)</td>
<td>7 Employees</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekday pm</td>
<td>710 (Office)</td>
<td>7 Employees</td>
<td>.46</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekday evening</td>
<td>560 (Church)</td>
<td>100 Seats</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekend Service</td>
<td>560 (Church)</td>
<td>850 Seats</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After review of the estimated trips generated by the site the office use will contribute very little to both the morning and evening peak hour traffic. The other heavier uses take place outside of the periods of peak use. Therefore the development of the property will have minimal impact on the functional class of W. Route 66.

LANDSCAPING AND LIGHTING
Landscaping will comply with the applicable ordinance at the time of permitting. Lighting shall comply with the applicable ordinance and Dark Skies Zone I requirements. Examples of fixture style and locations are included in submittal.

SIGNAGE
The proposed signage plan is included with this application. We are requesting larger signs for both the street and building, primarily to address safety concerns. The size allowance for this zoning is much too small for a vehicle to see the location, identify the entrance and permit a safe signaling distance, speed reduction and turn. The proposed signage plan will allow for appropriately sized signage per the drawings submitted with the CUP application. Signage
lighting will comply with Dark Skies requirements. The proposed signage plan was available at the neighborhood meeting and was met with favorable review.

ARCHITECTURAL PLAN
Architectural plans, including the proposed site plan and building elevations, are included in the submittal.
Supplemental Information
Response to Study Session Comments
Grace Community Church
Conditional Use Permit

SWI #18258

Parcel Number: 116-04-016
Section 24, T21N, R6E, G&SRM
Coconino County, Arizona

Submitted to:
Zach Schwartz
Coconino County Community Development
2500 N Fort Valley Road, Bldg. 1
Flagstaff, AZ 86001
Via email: zschwartz@coconino.az.gov

Submitted for:
Grace Community Church
5200 E. Cortland Blvd., Ste. A17
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

Submitted by:
Shephard - Wesnitzer, Inc.
110 W. Dale Avenue
Flagstaff, AZ 86001
(928) 773-0354

September 11, 2019
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY:
Thank you to the Planning and Zoning Commission and County Staff for your effort to review and approve our Conditional Use Permit. Grace Community Church is a vibrant congregation and County Stakeholder and we are faithful in our investment in the community’s future and the enhanced quality of life of the region.

As part of its application for Conditional Use Permit, Grace Community Church participated in the August 28, 2019 Study Session of the Planning and Zoning Commission. Based on the results of the Session and also staff commentary, it is our understanding that our project and application is substantially in compliance and subject to approval only requiring three areas of clarification. The Study Session included three areas of discussion: signage, dark-sky compatibility, and building height. The following and attached information is offered as clarification regarding how the project addresses these three areas. We have also included the project’s preliminary floor plans and elevations with additional scaling and use detail as requested. While these drawings are only conceptual in development, they indicate graphically the intended uses that are expressed in the application narrative. The attachments specifically include:

a. Signage Plan with comparative analysis, dated 9/9/2019 (18 pages)
b. Roof Height Study, dated 9/9/2019 (3 pages)
c. Floor Plans, 1st and 2nd floor, dated 9/11/2019 (2 pages)
d. North and East Elevations, dated 9/9/2019 (2 pages)

Upon this submittal, we have requested a staff conference on September 12 to review its completeness. We are fully prepared to provide any additional clarification if necessary. Also, if appropriate, we request a copy of the official staff report and recommendation upon its distribution on September 16, 2019. All of this underscores the importance of an acceptable Conditional Use Permit in our development, which is a contingency for the purchase of the property, scheduled for October 2019.

SIGNAGE:
A revised signage plan is included with this supplement. The plan alters the proposed monument sign to include a dark background and light letters. The building-mounted sign has been reduced significantly from that originally proposed. The proposed reverse halo lit internal illumination will comply with all Dark-Sky restrictions governing these applications. Additionally, signage lighting will be on timers to provide for automatic dimming and shut-off as discussed in the dark-sky compatibility section below.

The size of sign allowed by right in this General zoning is very minimal, and inappropriate for the proposed community facility. This encourages discussion with community planners to determine the appropriate sizing for various uses in such a broad zoning classification. To inform this discussion, and to place the proposed sign in context, we have included a comparative summary. These sheets compare the proposed sign to that of neighboring properties, and to those of other community facilities within the County. We have included among these the Fort Tuthill and Coconino Community College signs as our revised plan reflects design elements of these two signs.

DARK-SKY COMPATIBILITY:
The application clarifies that project lighting will comply with applicable ordinances and Dark Skies Zone I requirements. At the Study Session, the commission also discussed the light trespass from within the building that could negatively affect the dark-sky environment, which is not covered by current
ordinance. To address these concerns, the applicant proposes to include timing devices that provide automatic dimming and shut-off of the concourse lighting per the following schedule. Additionally, internal light emission will be limited with the use of protective film and/or physical shades on automatic timers per the same schedule below.

**9:00 pm:** All signage and concourse lighting off. Schedule will be daily, unless an event is scheduled that extends beyond these hours, in which case the lights would be off not more than 30 minutes after the event's conclusion. For safety, exterior lighting will also be activated if a person or car enters the property.

**BUILDING HEIGHT:**
During the Study Session, it was recommended that the proposed building height be shown in the context of neighboring properties. The attached roof height study shows the proposed building compared to the zoning heights of the neighboring high-density residential and commercial zoning. The study also shows the heights permitted in each zone with administrative adjustments.

The elevations shown in the application and the attached study are preliminary in development and may adjust down as the design is refined. As a condition of use, the project can commit not to exceed the figures shown in the study. Rounding up to the nearest foot, these are: a maximum mean peak height of 41', a maximum peak height of 57', and a maximum of 22% area under roof above 40'.
SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION
RESPONSE TO STUDY SESSION COMMENTS
GRACE COMMUNITY CHURCH
CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

SIGNAGE PLAN
WITH
COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS
Grace Community Church Road Sign
Grace Letters 2’-6” High
Grace Length 13’-6”
Cross 3’x4’
Overall Length 20’
Overall Height 8’
Face Stone Base and Pedestal
Plexiglass or Medal Letters
Cross and Letters Internally Illuminated
Monument Sign [Qty. 1]
Monument sign with natural stone base with internally illuminated faux rust painted aluminum sign cabinet and structure. Cabinet will have push-thru acrylic with brushed aluminum FCO overlay copy.
Night View Reverse halo lit internal illumination for Dark Sky Compliance
Push thru acrylic examples.
Reverse Pan Channel Letters Examples

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of SIGNARAMA. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual outside without written consent of SIGNARAMA.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Letter Height: 72"
Letter Width: 331"
Total Sign Area: 165.5 sqft

Existing Coca-Cola Building Sign

Letter Height: 78"
Letter Width: 222"
Total Sign Area: 120.25 sqft
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Timber Sky Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 36"
Width of Sign Panel: 198"
Total Sign Panel Area: 49.5 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of SIGNARAMA. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside out outside without written consent of SIGNARAMA.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Fort Tuthill Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 35"
Width of Sign Panel: 265"
Total Sign Panel Area: 64.4 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of Signarama. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside out outside without written consent of Signarama.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Horsemen Lodge Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 120"
Width of Sign Panel: 360"
Total Sign Panel Area: 300 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of Signarama. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside or outside without written consent of Signarama.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Buddy's Repair Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 98"
Width of Sign Panel: 144"
Total Sign Panel Area: 98 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of SIGNARAMA. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside or outside without written consent of SIGNARAMA.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Coconino County College Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 52"
Width of Sign Panel: 376"
Total Sign Panel Area: 135.7 sqft
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Flagstaff Public Works Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 66"
Width of Sign Panel: 139"
Total Sign Panel Area: 63.7 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of Signarama. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside or outside without written consent of Signarama.
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48"
Width of Sign Panel: 155"
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Pine Canyon Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 60"
Width of Sign Panel: 81.5"
Total Sign Panel Area: 33 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of Signarama. It may not be reproduced, copied or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual without written consent of Signarama.

Color:

Notes:
Proposed Building Sign for Grace Community Church

Height of Sign Panel: 48”
Width of Sign Panel: 155”
Total Sign Panel Area: 51.6 sqft

Existing Kit Carson RV Park Sign

Height of Sign Panel: 144”
Width of Sign Panel: 294”
Total Sign Panel Area: 294 sqft

This design and drawing submitted for your review and approval is the exclusive property of Signarama. It may not be reproduced, copied, exhibited or utilized for any purpose, in part or in whole by any individual inside or outside without written consent of Signarama.
Building Sign / Qty. [x1]
Reverse pan channel aluminum letters with back lit halo LED illumination (Letters will have aluminum face/returns and lexan backs).
Night View
Reverse halo lit internal illumination for Dark Sky Compliance
Grace Community Church Wall Sign - North Elevation

Grace Letters 44' x 7'
Cross 11' x 8'
Plexiglass or Medal Letters
Cross and Letters Internally Illuminated
SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION
RESPONSE TO STUDY SESSION COMMENTS
GRACE COMMUNITY CHURCH
CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

NORTH AND EAST ELEVATIONS
SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION
RESPONSE TO STUDY SESSION COMMENTS
GRACE COMMUNITY CHURCH
CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

ROOF HEIGHT STUDY
A triforium is an interior gallery, opening onto the tall central space of a building at an upper level. In a church, it opens onto the nave from above the side aisles; it may occur at the level of the clerestory windows, or it may be located as a separate level below the clerestory.
Roof Height Study: percent of Triforium above 40'

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total area under roof</td>
<td>33,290</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total roof above 40'</td>
<td>7,210</td>
<td>21.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total roof below 40'</td>
<td>26,080</td>
<td>78.34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Roof Height Study: Neighbor Height Limits

- Max Height (w/o Internal Add)
- Max Height – Administrative Adjustment
- Requested add for Triforum

Timber Sky  Grace  West Property
Citizen Participation Plan

Applicant Name: Grace Community Church

Mailing Address: 5200 E. Cortland Blvd., Suite A17, Flagstaff, AZ 86004

Phone: 928-853-5889

E-mail: briancketter@gmail.com

Property Address or Parcel Number(s): 116-04-016 1050 feet east of intersection of Flagstaff Ranch Road & Route 66

Brief Description of Conditional Use Permit and/or Zone Change: Conditional Use Permit for the development of a church within a General Zoning District.

1. Which residents, property owners, interested parties and public and private agencies may be affected by the application? (This may consist of the area of notification mailing list, which can be attached to this Plan.) List the notification radius in feet or miles as identified by Community Development staff.

The mailing list provided by Coconino County has been attached. The mailing list consisted of all properties located within a 1,000 foot radius.

2. How will those interested in and potentially affected by an application be notified that an application has been made?

As part of the public hearing process the affected properties will be sent an additional mailer informing them of the public hearing. A sign will also be posted on the property informing them of the potential development.
3. How will those interested and potentially affected parties be informed of the substance of the zone change, amendment, or development proposed by the application?

A neighborhood meeting was held on August 15th, 2019 and all that attended were informed of the County process and the nature of the Conditional Use Permit being sought.

4. How will those interested and affected parties be provided an opportunity to discuss the applicant's proposal with the applicant and express any concerns, issues, or problems they may have with the proposal in advance of the public hearing?

A neighborhood meeting was held on August 15th, 2019 and the properties identified on the County developed mailing list were invited to attend to discuss the nature of the project. Attendees were encouraged to ask questions and leave comments. All comments and questions received are attached to this plan.

5. What is the applicant's schedule for completion of the citizen participation plan?

A neighborhood meeting was held on August 15th, 2019 and all comments and questions received during the meeting are attached. Any additional comments or questions received prior to the public hearing will be forwarded to County staff.

6. How will the applicant keep the County Community Development Department informed on the status of citizen participation efforts?

Any additional comments or questions that are received prior to the public hearing will be forwarded to County staff.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner Name</th>
<th>Owner Address 1</th>
<th>Owner City</th>
<th>Owner State</th>
<th>Owner Zip</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARC 5524 LLC</td>
<td>181 SILVER MAPLE RD</td>
<td>GROVELAND</td>
<td>FL</td>
<td>34736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY</td>
<td>PO BOX 53999, MS 9565</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>850723940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BHB INVESTMENT PROPERTIES LLC</td>
<td>PO BOX 60156</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BNSF RAILWAY COMPANY</td>
<td>PROPERTY TAX DEPARTMENT</td>
<td>FORT WORTH</td>
<td>TX</td>
<td>76161-0089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOYER RC &amp; PM TRUST DTD 10/9/98 ; 1145 WEST KAIBAB LANE LLC</td>
<td>6090 W FORT VALLEY RANCH RD</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIRST AMERICAN TITLE INS CO TRUST NO 8720</td>
<td>2502 E CAMELBACK RD STE 214</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLAGSTAFF CITY OF</td>
<td>211 W ASPEN AVE</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLAGSTAFF RANCH SELF-STORAGE LLC</td>
<td>1425 W FOREST MEADOWS ST</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOSCH FAMILY LIVING TRUST</td>
<td>4392 W ROUTE 66</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARKEY F SURVIVORS TRUST DTD 12-02-92</td>
<td>4341 E KACHINA TRL</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85044</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARKEY WILLARD W FAMILY REVOCABLE TRUST DTD 12-02-92</td>
<td>4341 E KACHINA TRL</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85044</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEATWOLE JAY &amp; ANNE</td>
<td>PO BOX 2061</td>
<td>PRESCOTT</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HINDERLITER TIMOTHY R</td>
<td>2082 W TOBOGGAN CT</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUSS JOSHUA LEWIS</td>
<td>3835 HARKEY RANCH RD</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KOHL ROLAND R &amp; JUDITH A</td>
<td>4550 W ROUTE 66</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LINDHOLM ROBERT LEE</td>
<td>PO BOX 846</td>
<td>SALIDA</td>
<td>CO</td>
<td>81201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LONG COLD WINTER INVESTMENTS LLC</td>
<td>PO BOX 147</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LUKE INVESTORS PARTNERSHIP</td>
<td>PO BOX 10775</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N &amp; J PROPERTIES VII LLC</td>
<td>3230 N SHOWDOWN PL</td>
<td>TUCSON</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLFERS FAMILY TRUST DTD 06/10/13</td>
<td>4656 W ROUTE 66</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTTER HAROLD</td>
<td>4410 W ROUTE 66</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SASKAN RANCH HOMEOWNER'S ASSOCIATION</td>
<td>PO BOX 22024</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELTZER DANA &amp; WENDA</td>
<td>3101 N MANOR DR</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STARA INVESTMENTS LLC</td>
<td>302 N VERDE ST</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWIRE PACIFIC HOLDINGS INC</td>
<td>12634 S 265 W</td>
<td>DRAPER</td>
<td>UT</td>
<td>84020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THORNTON TIMOTHY N &amp; HEATHER L</td>
<td>PO BOX 1669</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THRASH MERLIN RUSSELL</td>
<td>809 W RIORDAN PMB420</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRIPLE J LIVING TRST U/A DTD 5-4-15</td>
<td>908 WEST MURRAY RD</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRIPLE J LIVING TRST U/A DTD 5-4-15</td>
<td>908 WEST MURRAY RD</td>
<td>FLAGSTAFF</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>86001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VP 66 &amp; WOODY MOUNTAIN LLC</td>
<td>2502 E CAMELBACK RD NO 214</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASTE MANAGEMENT OF ARIZONA INC</td>
<td>PO BOX 1450</td>
<td>CHICAGO</td>
<td>IL</td>
<td>60690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANZUCCHI JAMES</td>
<td>128 E MARLETTE AVE</td>
<td>PHOENIX</td>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>85012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Community Meeting for Grace Community Church – August 15, 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Phone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tony Melnie Good</td>
<td>4392 W Route 66</td>
<td>928-647-1172</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mstoneyork@gmail.com">mstoneyork@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rollie &amp; Judy Kohl</td>
<td>4550 US, Rte 66</td>
<td>918-310-1311</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ruli.kohl@gmail.com">ruli.kohl@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Gusch</td>
<td>4392 We Route 69, April, PA 237</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email:</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mhslumiework@gmail.com">mhslumiework@gmail.com</a></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>FYC wanted additional time to the area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Very appreciative of initial plans.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I would highly recommend the City grant.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Community Meeting for Grace Community Church – August 15, 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name: Rollie Kohl</th>
<th>Address: 4550 W. Route 66</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Email: <a href="mailto:rollkohl@gmail.com">rollkohl@gmail.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment: I attended the community meeting concerning Grace Community Church last evening. The building plan was explained to me and as a potential neighbor I found nothing that would make me oppose this project. In fact I believe it would enhance our neighborhood unless something drastic were to emerge. I am in favor of the project. The meeting was well conducted.

Transcribed from phone call from Rollie Kohl on 8-16-19, 11:15 a.m. per his request since his email is down and due to age and handwriting. Both he and his wife were impressed with the photos and outlines of the building.
A Neighborhood Meeting was held for the Grace Community Church-Conditional Use Permit on August 15th, 2019 at the Double Tree Hotel. Below is a list of the questions/comments posed by the residents in attendance and the responses presented during the meeting.

1. What type of church will this one be?
   - The church gets its roots from a Baptist background. The best way to describe the teaching is as an Evangelical Christian Church. The church is very Word based.

2. What portion of the building would we be looking at from across Route 66 to the north?
   - The view from the north would be looking at the northeast corner of the building. It would be the left end of the NW elevation view. The view would be to the lower portion of the building. The peak runs along the east/west line.

3. What exterior material will be used for the Building?
   - The walls and lower portions of the columns will be a split face stone. The look of the building will be fitting for the Flagstaff area.

4. What is the setback from W. Route 66?
   - The required setback is 30 feet. The building is currently 54 feet from the property line this may change slightly, but would not encroach into the required 30 feet.

5. Will the church be renting out the building to other groups?
   - The church is not planning on renting out any of the space continuously. However it will rent space for events like weddings and funerals.

6. What is the membership size of the church?
   - The weekly attendance for the Sunday service is typically between 300 and 400.

7. Will there be a pipe organ at the church?
   - The church does not have a pipe organ. However, if someone was willing to donate or provide money to purchase an organ and then find someone who could play it they could have a conversation regarding the organ.

8. Where will the monument sign be located and what material will be used?
   - The location of the monument sign on the site plan was pointed out. It will be in the northeast corner next to the access. The sign materials were explained. It was also explained that the church was requesting to have a larger monument sign, and signage on the building, than what is allowed by the County Ordinance.

9. Can you build it now?
   - The church would like to build now but it is actually early in the process. The process of approval of the Conditional Use Permit was explained.

10. A brief discussion was held on whether any traffic signals were planned along W. Route 66 at Flagstaff Ranch Road and Woody Mountain Road.
**NOTE:** All site lighting to meet Coconino County Zone 1 Ordinance

a) Lighting will be designed per IDA's best practices. Fully shielded lights typical.

b) Total site lumens per Ordinance

c) Timers, sensors and other devices will be used to meet curfews, safety and energy savings.

**Legend**

- Single Street Light
- Double Parking Light
- Bollard
- Wall Light
Examples of landscape design by areas

The landscape engineer will choose which plantings will be included in the design. The finished design will meet all applicable standards at time of design and be structured to meet all requirements of the site.

Additionally, the finished design will meet the high standards demanded by the client.
Date: September 25, 2019
To: Planning and Zoning Commission
From: Department of Community Development
Subject: Public Hearing and consideration of Case Number CUP-19-036, a request for a community health center

Executive Summary

Recommendation: Staff recommends approval with the five conditions recommended below.

Location: The property is located at 15645 Leupp Road approximately four miles west of Indian Route 70 and is identified as Assessor’s Parcel Number 303-25-003R.
Parcel Size: 29.97 acres

Supervisor District: #4 (Jim Parks)

Current Zoning: G (General, 10-acre minimum parcel size)

Owner/Applicant: Kathrine Hawke, Flagstaff, Arizona

Background Information

Background

The subject property is vacant and there does not appear to have been any previous development on the site. The parcel was recently combined with approximately half of the adjacent parcel to the east to create the subject property with almost 30 acres. An unimproved roadway was acquired with this land, and it provides access to the south across a 180-foot section of State Trust land to Leupp Road via a cattle guard. The applicant has not provided documentation of an easement for the unimproved roadway, and it is not clear the applicant has legal access across this portion of State Trust Land. The subject property is located within Sun Leupp Ranches, a large lot land division completed in 1961 that included access easements around the perimeter of the subject property. This is a typical situation where local topography was not taken into account when these easements were established, and roads were created that provide physical, but not always legal access. The applicant must either provide documentation of the legal right to cross this section of State Trust land and improve it to the required standards, or develop a new access via the existing access easement that connects to Leupp Road to the east. The subject property is not located within a fire district and must provide documentation emergency fire and ambulance services will be provided.
Map showing existing access easements (hashed areas) around the subject property

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surrounding Land Uses/Zoning</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Use</strong></td>
<td><strong>Zoning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Site</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>Residential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>State Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>State Trust</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Natural Features**

| Topography                  | The property rises from the south near Leupp Road to the north with the steepest areas especially in the northwest corner of the property |
| Natural Resources           | The property contains native vegetation primarily consisting of juniper trees and shrubs |

Aerial Photo
Proposed Development

Summary of Proposal

The applicant has submitted a site plan (included in the Commission packet) and a narrative describing the proposed use (Exhibit 1). Basic elevations of the proposed center are also provided. The proposed community health center would provide treatment services to the local Navajo community for various types of emotional trauma and will also be used for community gatherings including community events and workshops. Future cottages (shown on the site plan) are proposed to provide a potential expansion of the center along with a home for the director. A staff of six will work at the site including therapists, a doctor and clerical staff, and one staff member will live on the site to provide security for this remote location. Healing retreats are also proposed that will require overnight stays for people traveling a distance for intensive treatment. The buildings are designed to fit into the natural landscape along the base of the ridge and will be visible from Leupp Road. The applicant proposes 22 parking spaces based on the square footage and number of staff members. The proposed parking will also be adequate for community events that will be limited to 60 people. Utilities are shown on the site plan indicating the applicant will use solar panels, a water tank for hauled water, and liquid propane gas, which is appropriate for this remote area. A paving waiver will be required for the
parking area and access road to allow the installation of aggregate in lieu of paving. These areas will be constructed according to the standards determined by the Engineering Division.

**Citizen Participation**

A neighborhood meeting was held at Star School a short distance from the property on May 14, 2019. Four neighbors attended in person and one attended by phone. Concerns expressed were related to outdoor lighting and access by neighbors who use the road to access their properties. The applicant intends to allow continued use of the road as long as problems do not arise. Minimal, fully-shielded outdoor lighting is also proposed to avoid impacts to neighbors who use telescopes.

**Staff Analysis**

### Compliance with the Comprehensive Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Use: Community Health Center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Natural Resources:**
16. Construction plans for development, infrastructure improvements, and forest restoration projects will include a plan for minimum disturbance of native vegetation and soils.
17. Landscaping for new developments shall emphasize minimizing the area disturbed and using native plants and drought-tolerant species that are appropriate to the area. Revegetating disturbed areas will be required in most cases and planting/seeding native species will be strongly encouraged.

**Community Character:**
11. The County supports the development of neighborhood commercial uses, community facilities (including shared), and activities that promote and generate public interaction.
12. The County supports community facilities and activities that promote a greater sense of place by enhancing community identity and local pride.

**Community Services:**
**Goal:** Prioritize the health and wellness of residents and visitors.
18. The County will proactively address the leading health issues of residents such as chronic disease, vector borne illness, reproductive health, food borne illness, and injury prevention.

### Compliance with the Zoning Ordinance

- Health centers are similar to hospitals, which are allowed in the General Zone through approval of a conditional use permit (Section 2.1.B.25)

**Setbacks:**
Buildings are proposed primarily in the middle of the site within the required setbacks.
Setbacks will be approved through the building permit process.

**Lighting:**
Minimal lighting is proposed and must meet the requirements of Section 4.4, Lighting

**Signs:**
Any Signage must meet the requirements of Section 4.2, Signs.

**Landscaping:**
The applicant proposes using installing minimal landscaping using permaculture principles and retaining existing native trees and shrubs

---

**Findings of Staff**

**Findings of Fact required to approve a Conditional Use Permit**

1. **That the proposed location of the conditional use is in accord with the objectives of this Ordinance and the purpose of the zone in which the site is located.**
   
   *Staff’s Response: The isolated site is appropriate for the use and will allow the facility to serve the local community.*

2. **That the proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which it would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity.**
   
   *Staff’s Response: The community health center will not create significant impacts to properties in the vicinity.*

3. **That the proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of this Ordinance, except for approved variances.**
   
   *Staff’s Response: The proposed conditional use permit meets the requirement of the Zoning Ordinance except where waivers are required for paving and landscaping.*

4. **That the proposed conditional use is consistent with and conforms to the goals, objectives and policies of the General Plan or Specific Plan for the area.**

   *Staff’s Response: The proposed development complies with the Comprehensive Plan based on the goals and policies cited in the staff report.*

---

**Recommendation of Staff**

The proposal will provide a needed service for the local population in a remote location where off-grid electric and utility services would be provided. The large size of the property and the use of limited, fully-shielded lighting would reduce impacts to nearby neighbors. The applicant would be required to provide legal access to the property and meet road improvement standards to accommodate emergency vehicles as determined by the Engineering Division. The request meets the required findings along with the goals and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, and staff recommends approval of the application.
Recommended Conditions of Approval

1. The development shall substantially comply with the approved site plan and proposed use as described in the narrative.

2. The applicant shall provide documentation of the legal right to use the portion of the unimproved roadway that crosses State Trust land as access to the site and improve it to the required standards, or the applicant shall develop a new access road via the existing access easement.

3. A paving waiver is granted allowing use of aggregate in lieu of paving for the parking area and access road and must meet road improvement standards as approved by the Engineering Division to support a 42,000 lb. emergency vehicle. All required disabled parking spaces must be paved as approved by the Building Division.

4. A landscaping waiver is granted allowing retention of existing native trees and shrubs in lieu of the landscaping requirements in Section 4.4, Landscaping. Additional landscaping may be installed as proposed by the applicant.

5. A lighting permit shall be approved prior to the installation of any outdoor lighting. Lighting shall be limited to the greatest extent practical, and all lighting shall be fully-shielded.

6. A Letter of Service shall be provided from a local fire district indicating emergency fire and ambulance services will be provided.

Respectfully submitted,

Jess McNeely, AICP, Assistant Director
Prepared by Bob Short, Principal Planner

Attachments

Exhibit 1 – Applicant Narrative
Hozhó iliná Community Health Center Narrative

This application is for a community based health center that will serve the same general area as the nearby STAR School. In addition, clients will come from a distance for therapy and professional training. The applicant, Katherine (Kate) Hawke was one of the co-founders of the STAR School, which was originally envisioned and approved with a school building plus a trauma healing and training center. Now, nineteen years later, that center is being planned just off of Leupp Rd. within walking distance of the school.

The name of the center will be Hozhó iliná, translated as Beautiful (or Harmonious) Life in Navajo. It is intended to serve the local population, which is largely Navajo, but will be accessible to all. Services will be focused on healing emotional trauma: historical, family, and personal. Currently there is an increasing recognition of the importance of healing the effects of trauma, from combat trauma, sexual abuse, and loss of loved ones, to the things that happen to nearly all of us, and the center is designed to address these needs. Especially among Native American communities there is a movement to end the cycle that continues these devastating effects from generation to generation.

As Arizona’s first Certified Trauma Specialist, having worked for thirty years as a trauma therapist in this community, Kate Hawke welcomes this awakening. She is committed to providing the most effective treatment available to individuals, groups, and the community as a whole. Having a safe and beautiful place to do this work is essential.

The property is a 30 acre parcel, which consists of a combined 20 acre parcel plus 10 acres which were recently added. Vegetation consists of juniper trees, native perennial bushes, grasses, and annual flowers. All vegetation will be preserved as much as possible. Landscaping will utilize permaculture principles and require minimal watering.

Initially one site-built structure is proposed, which will serve as the main Hozhó iliná Center. This building will be used for group gatherings (community events and professional workshops), trauma therapy offices, and administration. Future phases may include cottages for more trauma therapy capacity and a residence for the Director.

We anticipate a staff of six, including three therapists, one M.D., and a receptionist. One staff member will be a live-in caretaker for security reasons in this remote location. In addition to regular business hours, some services (healing retreats) will require overnight stays for those traveling at a distance or doing intensive work. However, this is not planned as a long-term residential treatment center.

The parking lot will have spaces for a minimum of 22 vehicles, calculated by the following formula:

* 1 space for every 250 sq. ft. of floor area = 12 for building under 3000 sq. ft.
* Plus 1 space for each employee on the largest shift = 6 maximum employees
Road will be developed to standards set by Engineering Department.

Main building and cottage structure sites will be over 300' from any property line. Exact distances from property lines and between structures will be determined after further site evaluation, and will exceed the minimum requirements.

All structures will be built of high quality materials and sited to fit into the natural landscape. The center will be visible and inviting from Leupp Road.

This project will conform to the Findings for a Conditional Use Permit and will be in compliance with the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan.
Coconino County Community Development – Updated 1/25/18
Citizen Participation Report

Citizen Participation Report Applicant Name: Kate Hawke
Mailing Address: 77 Leupp Rd, Flagstaff, AZ  86004
Phone: 928-606-3774
E-mail: kate@tttn.org
Property Address or Parcel Number(s): 303-25-003R

Brief Description of Conditional Use Permit and/or Zone Change:
Application for a Community Health Center focusing on healing emotional trauma.

1. Please list the dates and locations of all meetings where citizens were invited to discuss the applicant’s proposal: Neighborhood Community Meeting was held at STAR School on May 14th.
2. Please attach and note the content, dates mailed, and numbers of mailings, including Community Meeting letter(s), other meeting notices, newsletters and other publications (if applicable): ATTACHED
3. Where are residents, property owners, and interested parties receiving notices, newsletters, or other written materials located? (This may consist of the area of notification mailing list, which can be attached to this Plan.) List the notification radius in feet or miles as identified by Community Development staff. 1000’ radius. ATTACHED
4. Please list the number of people that participated in the process and the percentage of those notified that participated in the process: 4 neighbors participated in person, plus one by phone. This is 71% of all who were notified.
5. Please list the substance of the concerns, issues, and problems raised per citizen input:

*Lighting that could affect telescope use in the area.

*Road access: Neighbors have been using the dirt road that runs through the property for Leupp Rd. access. This doesn’t directly affect the home access of any neighbors who attended the meeting, but they brought up the concern on behalf of themselves and others. There are other routes to access properties off of Leupp Rd, but they are less convenient.

6. How will the applicant address the concerns, issues and problems that were expressed during the process?

Lighting for the proposed project will be designed to meet requirements for shielded light fixtures. Other than meeting code and providing safe walkways, we will minimize outdoor lighting. There is a hill between the proposed site and the primary area of concern for telescopes. We wish to minimize any effect of lighting on neighbors.

We plan to keep the existing dirt road open as long as there are no significant issues. I will have a friendly talk with certain neighbors who have been in the habit of leaving beer cans and liquor bottles next to the road. As a 30-year resident of this neighborhood, I appreciate the value of customary use and good relationships within the community.

1. Please list any concerns, issues and problems the applicant is unwilling or unable to address, and why:
2. Any further comments from the applicant? All of the neighbors who attended the meeting expressed support for having a community health center. As veterans, two of them were particularly interested in the plans for trauma healing services for veterans and others.
May 3, 2019

Dear Neighbor,

I am the owner of Parcel #303-25-003I, on the north side of Leupp Rd. in the area west of the STAR School. I recently met with Coconino County Planning staff to discuss a proposal for a community Wellness Center on this 20 acre parcel, plus half of parcel 303-25-003K, which is along the east side of mine and includes the dirt road that provides Leupp Rd access. That means the 20 acre site will be extended to a total of 30 acres.

I will be requesting a Conditional Use Permit for a community Wellness Center as part of this project. Coconino County Community Development staff directed me to notify all property owners within 1000 feet of this property, and you are one of a total of seven landowners in this area.

I am proposing a building of under 3000 square feet (visible from Leupp Rd) in the first phase, plus several small cottages and an additional building (on the hill- not visible from any road) in future phases. All buildings are planned to make good use of natural materials and blend into the landscape. We will avoid unnecessarily disturbing vegetation or removing any trees if possible. Anyone who knows me from the STAR School is aware that I’m a dedicated protector of all plants- with the exception of tumbleweeds.

The name of the center will be Hozo' liina, or Harmonious Life in Navajo. Activities will include open community meetings, workshops, psychotherapy sessions, professional training events, and groups for STAR School students. This center is not officially part of the STAR School, but we will collaborate for the benefit of students and families.

Some of the community activities we have planned are yoga and exercise classes, and events to learn about healing psychological trauma. I have been a trauma therapist for 30 years, and have seen the power of effective techniques, so this is a particular interest of mine.

These activities will be held during normal business (and school) hours, and also in the evenings and on weekends. We do not anticipate hosting anything loud that can be heard by the neighbors.

There will be an on-site caretaker in residence, since properties in our rural area tend to attract vandals if they are left untended.

Traffic will be limited to a section of dirt road going to Leupp Rd. This only goes through a short stretch of state land and then onto my property.

Signs will be small and attractive, and not visible from the highway.

Lighting will be minimal, only what is required for safety, and will be shielded to conform with dark skies requirements.

I have attached a basic site plan of the project. As required by the Coconino County Zoning Ordinance, I will be holding a Neighborhood Community Meeting at the STAR School, 145 Leupp Rd., Flagstaff, AZ on May 14th at 6:00 PM. I hope you can attend. If you cannot attend the meeting, please feel free to call me at 928-606-3774 or send your comments to me at kate@ttm.org. I will be happy to talk or arrange for a time we can meet.

If I decide to move forward with a formal application for a Conditional Use Permit, my project will become a case at a public hearing of the Planning and Zoning Commission. You will be notified of the date and time of the public hearing if I apply. The Planning and Zoning Commission meets in the First Floor Meeting Room at the Coconino County Administration Building, 219 East Cherry Avenue in Flagstaff, Arizona. The Coconino County Community Development Department can be contacted at 928-679-8850 if you have questions about the public hearing process.

I look forward to telling you more about this dream, and listening to your ideas and any concerns, at the community meeting.

Sincerely,

Katherine (Kate) Hawke
August 22, 1961

TO: COCONINO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

FROM: C. F. LINTZ, COUNTY ENGINEER

SUBJECT: SUN-LEUPP RANCHES SUBDIVISION

The final plat of the Sun-Leupp Ranches, a proposed subdivision of three (3) sections, lying approximately 10 miles northeast of old Highway 66 along the new Leupp Road, into 100 acre lots has been reviewed by this office.

The Developer, Valley Land & Trust Company, has provided perimeter road right of ways of adequate width and has properly indicated the 100 foot wide right of way for the new Leupp Road.

Since all parcels exceed 40 acres in size, the development is not subject to the provisions of the Coconino County Subdivision Control Resolution. However, due to the rules of the State Real Estate Board, it is necessary for the Developer to file a plat of this subdivision.

It is the recommendation of this office that the plat be forwarded to the County Recorder with an authorization for recording.

C. F. Lintz, County Engineer

CFL/ps

cc: County Recorder

APPROVED

AUG 23 1961

Chairman Board Supervisors
Coconino County, Arizona